

# Transnational Associations

The review of the Union of International Associations



## 2/2000

After Seattle

Les ONG et les mines  
antipersonnel

Revue bimestrielle  
Mars - Avril 2000  
Bureau de dépôt Bruxelles X

# Associations transnationales

La revue de l'Union des associations internationales

## Transnational Associations *Associations transnationales*

*Transnational Associations* is a unique bilingual journal whose aim is to deal with major current problems within the perspective of international nongovernmental organizations. It is intended to provide a forum for authoritative information and independent reflection on the increasing role played by these organizations in the international system, and on its philosophical, political, economic or cultural implications.

The approach is intrinsically interdisciplinary, and calls for both specialist expertise and practitioner experience in transnational association matters. *Transnational Associations* provides background information about the actions and achievements of international associations, and insight into their interrelations with intergovernmental organizations. It covers a wide range of topics, among which social organization, humanitarian law, scientific cooperation, language and culture, economic development, to cite just a few.

The programme of the review, in accordance with the principles of the UIA, clarifies general awareness concerning the association phenomenon within the framework of international relations and, in particular, informs associations about aspects of the problems which they tend to share or which are of common interest to them. Contributors to the journal review include association officers, research workers and specialists of association questions who engage only themselves.

Founded in Brussels in 1907 as the Central Office of International Associations, the UIA became a federation under the present name in 1910 at the 1st World Congress of International Associations. Activities were closely associated with the Institut international de bibliographie, which later became the International Federation for Documentation. Its work contributed to the creation of the League of Nations and the International Institute of Intellectual Cooperation (the predecessor of UNESCO). During the 1920s, the UIA created an International University, the first of its kind.

The UIA has consultative relations with UNESCO, UN/ECOSOC, and ILO. It collaborates with FAO, the Council of Europe, UNITAR, and the Commonwealth Science Council.

Associations transnationales est la seule revue traitant des grands problèmes contemporains dans la perspective des organisations internationales non gouvernementales. Elle se propose d'apporter des éléments d'information provenant des sources les plus autorisées, propres à susciter une réflexion indépendante sur l'affirmation du rôle joué par ces acteurs dans le système international et sur les aspects philosophiques, politiques, sociaux et culturels de cette évolution.

La visée adoptée est essentiellement interdisciplinaire et fait appel au savoir comme à la pratique des spécialistes du champ d'action des associations transnationales. Les documents, articles et études publiés par Associations transnationales traitent également des liens établis entre celles-ci et les organisations intergouvernementales. Les domaines couverts s'étendent aux problèmes de société, au droit humanitaire, à la coopération scientifique, aux questions linguistiques et culturelles, au développement économique ou à tout phénomène affectant la vie de ces associations.

Le programme de la revue, conformément aux buts de l'UIA, vise à éclairer l'opinion sur la signification de la dimension associative des relations internationales, notamment en informant les associations au sujet des questions qui relèvent de leurs domaines ou affectent leurs intérêts communs. Les textes des auteurs publiés par la revue (dirigeants d'associations, chercheurs et spécialistes des questions associatives) n'engagent que leur opinion.

L'UIA a été créée officiellement en 1910 à Bruxelles au cours du premier congrès mondial des associations internationales. Ses fondateurs, le Sénateur Henri La Fontaine, prix Nobel de la Paix 1913 et Paul Otlet, Secrétaire général de l'Institut international de bibliographie, avaient mis sur pied en 1907 l'«Office central des institutions internationales» auquel l'UIA succéda sous la forme de fédération. En 1914, elle regroupait 230 organisations, soit un peu plus de la moitié de celles qui existaient à l'époque. L'UIA devait incarner, dans l'esprit de ses fondateurs, les aspirations internationalistes et les idéaux de paix qui animaient les associations et qui allaient aboutir en 1920 à la création de la Société des Nations.

L'UIA a obtenu le statut consultatif auprès de l'ECOSOC, de l'UNESCO et de l'OIT. Elle collabore avec l'UNITAR, la FAO et le Conseil de l'Europe. Elle entretient des relations générales et ponctuelles avec les organisations régionales.

After Seattle  
by Simon Retallack  
Page 50

International nongovernmental organizations  
and the globalization of victimhood  
by Peter A. Mameli  
Page 56

The landmine ban and NGOs:  
the role of communications technologies  
by Ken Rutherford  
Page 60

Religion at the Millennium  
By Edward Goldsmith  
Page 74

La charte des droits fondamentaux de l'Union Européenne  
Contribution de cafecs  
par Anne David  
Page 79

*Review Article*  
Feminism, Internationalism and Capitalism:  
The Plural and the Singular  
by Peter Waterman  
Page 82

Association News  
*Vie associative*  
Page 86

New International Organisations  
*Nouvelles organisations internationales*  
Page 91

## Transnational Associations *Associations transnationales*

# After Seattle: Where next for the WTO?

by Simon Retallack\*

*Last December's mass protests in Seattle were the biggest ever show of public outrage at the twisted priorities of the global trading system. Simon Retallack\* explores what really happened at the Seattle meeting of the World Trade Organisation, and asks where the WTO - and its opponents - should go from here. '*

Late last year on the streets and in the conference rooms of Seattle, the most north-westerly *dry* of the USA, there was an unmistakable feeling in the air: the sensation of history being made. There, in Seattle, the supposedly unstoppable force of economic globalisation faced its first major setback of the post-Cold War era at the hands of an unprecedented alliance of citizens' groups and government delegates from around the world. The principal target and casualty of their protests was the launch of a new 'Millennium' round of trade talks by an institution that the majority of the world's public and media had been largely unaware of until Seattle — the World Trade Organisation.

## The Lowdown

The WTO came into existence in January 1995 as a result of eight years of negotiations between 125 countries during the Uruguay Round of the General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade (GATT). It operates from Geneva, Switzerland, and has a membership of 135 countries. Its main official functions are to administer and enforce more than twenty international trade-related agreements, resolve trade disputes between states and provide a forum for global trade negotiations.

That, at least, is the official, innocuous-sounding purpose of the WTO. But strip away the bland bureaucratic facade, and the WTO reveals a more destructive nature. The *raison d'être* of this organisation is to eliminate barriers to international trade - 'barriers' which, according to WTO rules, include not only quotas and tariffs on products crossing national borders, but *any* impediments to corporate profit-making, such as national, regional or local laws protecting consumers, workers or the environment.

This agenda is forced through by tribunals made up of panels of three trade bureaucrats who have usually made legal careers representing corporate clients on trade issues. They meet in secret and have legally-binding powers of

enforcement, which include the ability to impose economically-severe trade sanctions on offending states.

*The Economist* has called the WTO "an embryo world government," and yet not an electorate on the planet has voted for it, nor is it in any meaningful way accountable to the public. Worse - at every opportunity during its five-year existence, the WTO has sacrificed the public interest on the altar of free trade and corporate gain.

## The WTO's Record

So far, among the national laws that WTO panels have ruled against and consequently caused to be weakened are the US Clean Air Act, the US Endangered Species Act, and Japan's pesticide residue standards for food. The WTO has also ruled against the EU's ban on imports of potentially health-threatening hormone-treated beef, and the EU's banana importing regime, designed to give preferential access to bananas produced by small farmers in the Caribbean. In these two cases, the WTO authorised the imposition of sanctions of \$128 million and \$190 million respectively per year until the EU implements its rulings.

Crucially, in every single one of these cases, WTO panels sided with the corporate parties involved: Venezuelan and Brazilian oil companies, Asian shrimp companies, and US fruit and beef companies respectively.

The WTO's track record is now such that the mere threat of WTO action is usually sufficient to persuade countries to change their laws to be 'WTO-compliant.' Under this so-called "chilling-effect", the US, for example, has succeeded in substantially weakening an EU ban on the import of fur from animals caught with cruel 'steel jaw' leg traps. At a sub-national level, the Governor of California recently vetoed his State's 'Buy Californian Act', a bill giving locally manufactured goods a 5% preference for state and local government purchases, because he said it would violate WTO rules.

\*Simon Retallack is Deputy Editor of *The Ecologist*. He was a researcher at the London-based think tank *Demos* and a visiting fellow

on Globalisation in San Francisco, for which he has just edited and co-written a report on the environmental impact of economic globalisation.

This article also appears in the second issue of *The Ecologist* of this year.

For more information on post-Seattle events see: [www.tradewatch.org](http://www.tradewatch.org), [www.50years.org](http://www.50years.org), and [www.fgf.org](http://www.fgf.org).

*Transnational Associations*  
2/2000, 50-55

All of these cases are symptomatic of far more serious, deep-seated trends that are being promoted. Environmental degradation, threats to public health, unemployment, income inequality, food insecurity, loss of cultural diversity and threats to human rights are all being *exacerbated* by the WTO and its agreements.

### **The Next Step: More Power to the WTO**

Despite the WTO's record, the world's two largest trading blocks intended to use the organisation's Third Ministerial Conference in Seattle — between November 30<sup>th</sup> and December 3<sup>rd</sup> — to *expand* the WTO's power.

The United States wanted the WTO to set up a working group to adopt new rules that would ensure unfettered "market access" globally for genetically modified products, despite growing environmental and health concerns. Another US priority was the adoption by the WTO of an 'Advanced Tariff Liberalisation Initiative' which, amongst other things, would have eliminated tariffs on forestry and fish products by 2004. This would have increased global demand for these products as their cost fell. The result: increased deforestation and further depletion of the world's already over-fished oceans.

An additional key US goal was the elimination of primarily European and Japanese agricultural tariffs and subsidies. While this could have had some positive environmental consequences, it could also have undermined small-scale, chemical-free agriculture, often dependent on subsidies and tariffs to avoid being undercut by floods of cheaper, industrially produced imports.

The American government also wanted to expand the WTO's General Agreement on Trade in Services (GATS) to include new sectors such as health and education. This would have given foreign corporations the right to take over, own and operate publicly-owned hospitals and schools within any WTO member country. Another US goal was to extend the WTO's Trade-Related Intellectual Property Rights Agreement (TRIPS) to *all* plant and animal parts, to enable them to be patented and controlled by corporations; depriving millions of farmers of the right to save and use their own

seeds without having to pay corporations to do so.

The EU's priority, meanwhile, was to expand the WTO's powers over investment, competition and procurement policy. The EU thereby sought to give foreign corporations the right to invest, undertake mergers or corporate take-overs, and bid for public procurement initiatives in each member country, free of any social or environmental conditions or discrimination with regard to subsidies or contracts. The EU's plans would have entailed, essentially, a return of the notorious Multilateral Agreement on Investment (MAI) that had been defeated by public protest in 1998.

These overwhelmingly corporate-driven agendas, moreover, were to be negotiated in secret (as has been the norm for each world trade round), without the participation or endorsement of the public, non-governmental organisations (NGOs), or, as it turned out, even the majority of the WTO's member governments.

### **Taking to the Streets**

Shut out of the process, alienated and disgusted by much of what was being negotiated, over 40,000 people came to Seattle to take to the historical recourse of last resort - the street. The result was the largest and most extraordinary demonstration in America since the Vietnam War, led by a rainbow coalition of labour, environmental, consumer, farming, human rights, and pro-democracy groups from around the world.

The official reaction to the protests demonstrated an authoritarian intolerance of democratic dissent that spoke volumes about the nature of the WTO and its attitude towards ordinary people. It told millions globally that there must be something very wrong with this institution if it needs to defend itself by firing at overwhelmingly peaceful protestors with rubber bullets, canisters of tear gas and excruciating pepper spray; charging people on horseback and with armoured cars; arresting hundreds (though *not* any of the 40-or-so black-hooded 'anarchists' causing the widely-reported violence); and then imposing an armed curfew over the area in which it was meeting.

The drama on the streets, meanwhile, was mirrored by what took place inside the negotia-

tions, which, to general astonishment, suddenly collapsed in chaos, confusion and failure late on December 3. If you believe the humiliated supporters of the WTO, this outcome was essentially the product of 'mismanagement', whereas the impact of the opposition of civil society was 'minimal'.

In reality, the role of the protests was far more important. Until Seattle, trade negotiations and summits had taken place without the presence, in any significant number, of protestors, NGOs or the media. Indeed, the launch of the last world trade round in Punta del Este in Uruguay in 1986 took place "in the silence of public apathy," as Mike Moore, the WTO's current Director General, put it. This meant that government trade officials could make deals fulfilling an essentially Northern, corporate agenda and impose it on the rest of the world with impunity. In Seattle all that changed.

### The Power of Protest and Grassroots Opposition

Years of quiet educating and coalition-building on world trade issues by groups such as Public Citizen, the Third World Network, the International Forum on Globalization and many others finally paid off at Seattle. Not only did 2000 NGOs turn up with a veritable army of around 40,000 protestors, but an unprecedented alliance was forged between groups that represent a vast spectrum of societal concerns - including, crucially, on labour and environmental issues — united in common opposition to the WTO and its aims. They sent a direct message to the world's governments that civil society would not tolerate a World Trade Organisation, or any new trade round that failed to address social and environmental concerns and that merely served the interests of large corporations and their shareholders.

The protestors were powerful and numerous enough not to be ignored; deriving strength not just from their numbers and diversity, but, above all, from the fact that their message resonated loudly with important electoral constituencies and the wider public. The scale and drama of the demonstrations also drew the largest media presence to any world trade meeting in history, enabling the protestors' message to be relayed to

an audience of hundreds of millions worldwide. Members of the media, many of whom were learning on the spot about the WTO for the first time themselves, also scrutinised the negotiations as they never had before. All of this made it far easier (or far more important) for governments to resist the usual pressures to conform and agree a deal at all costs; creating the conditions for the development of unbridgeable divisions among the WTO's member governments which ultimately brought the talks to their knees.

Thus the objections of small farmers and their supporters demonstrating in Seattle, reflecting the views of powerful domestic farming constituencies, provided a serious incentive for the countries of the EU, with support from Japan and South Korea, to resist attempts by the US and the Cairns Group of 18 agricultural exporting nations, to force them to eliminate agricultural subsidies and tariffs. Hence EU Trade Commissioner Pascal Lamy's acknowledgement during the talks that "What's happening outside is having an effect on the negotiations." The protests, he said, made it "even less possible" to give in on this issue.

Similarly, the hostility of the demonstrators and the vast majority of the European public towards genetically modified food made it politically hazardous for the EU to concede to the key US demand to establish a WTO working group on biotechnology that would have made it harder for countries to limit imports of biotech products. When the EU trade commissioner indicated he might cave in on this issue, EU Environment Ministers, fearing the public outcry that would result, openly objected and forced the proposal to be dropped.

The opposition of demonstrators and a large number of important US labour and environmental groups to the key EU demand to begin negotiations on a new MAI-style agreement on investment, meanwhile, made the US reluctant to concede on *this* issue. That further diminished the possibility of an overall deal between the US and the EU at Seattle.

### The 'Third World' Resists

An even more significant factor in the ultimate collapse of the negotiations was the unprecedented opposition by the majority of

developing countries - which make up two thirds of the WTO's membership - to the launch of a new round, and their demand, opposed by the US, for the revision of elements of the previous round. In unison with the protestors, many adopted the slogan "No new round. Turnaround." In this, NGOs such as the Third World Network, which represents literally millions of 'Third World' citizens, were instrumental; briefing delegates about the likely adverse impacts on developing countries of the adoption of the new issues being pushed by developed countries, and of various existing agreements.

The US generated even more opposition from developing countries by refusing to rescind 'anti-dumping' legislation, which prevents the export of below-cost products to the US; refusing to implement commitments to cut quotas on imports of developing countries' textiles; and refusing to drop its proposal for the establishment of a WTO working group to look into the protection of core labour standards. The only reason the US took such a stance on these issues was because of the vocal demand of the protestors and labour unions throughout America that jobs and labour standards should not be undermined by free trade. Too many votes were now at stake, not least for Vice Presidential candidate Al Gore, for a new trade round to be launched that failed to take into account at least some of the protestors' concerns on these issues. As Sue Esserman, a US Deputy Trade Representative said, "The clear expression of concern by ordinary workers has to be taken into consideration, and that's exactly what we have done."

The final straw for developing countries was the way in which they were treated during the negotiations. As the protestors and NGOs had long been pointing out, the WTO operated in a grossly undemocratic manner in Seattle. It allowed all the key decisions to be made in so-called 'Green Room' meetings of around 20 countries — excluding most developing country delegates who were kept in the dark, misinformed, or deprived of interpreters and accurate texts. They were essentially reduced to the role of spectators who were nonetheless expected to provide their consent to a collection of decisions that they had virtually no part in shaping and to which they were largely opposed. Such practice

has long been the norm of global trade negotiations, and developing countries, in the end, have always given in. But not this time.

What made the difference in Seattle, according to several delegates, was the atmosphere of dissent generated by the demonstrators on the streets, the encouragement of NGOs in the conference hall, and the scrutinising presence of the world's media. All of these factors gave developing countries the resolve and strength to stand firm and, for the first time, remain united in opposition to the launch of a new round.

The US hosts - unable to bridge differences by making concessions that would have infuriated the protestors and their powerful domestic constituencies, and unable to force a *fait accompli* upon the developing world without inciting their full fury before the world's TV cameras — had no option but to allow the talks to collapse.

## The Fallout

It is no exaggeration to claim that history was made in Seattle, for the events there have already brought fundamental change. The authority and legitimacy of the WTO have been seriously undermined, as has the WTO's guiding philosophy that people and the natural world should serve economic and corporate ends as part of an inevitable process of economic globalisation. The WTO's members are in disarray, with the governments of the EU and the US, and of the North and the South, still divided by substantial differences. They are unlikely to be able to make much progress in the negotiations now underway in Geneva on services and agriculture, or even *attempt* to launch a new trade round until a new US President is in the White House early next year. Trade negotiators are highly aware of the fact that a second defeat on the scale of Seattle would probably be fatal for the WTO. Clearly on the defensive, they now accept that the WTO needs at least some reform and that new voices must now be heard.

Civil society, on the other hand, is stronger than ever, as is *its* guiding philosophy - that trade and corporate interests should be subservient to human and environmental needs. Building on its successes against 'fast-track' in the US in

1997, and the MAI in 1998, it launched in Seattle the most significant international, democratic, broad-based, grassroots challenge to global capitalism of the post-Cold War era.

It is powerful because it is more organised, united, and aware of its strength than ever before, and its message has, for the first time, reached the worlds media and, through it, millions of people throughout the globe. It has thereby removed the keys to the WTO's past success: ignorance and apathy. From now on, the world will be watching, making it far harder for trade ministers to strike deals that run counter to the public interest. Civil society now has a place at the top table and a voice that cannot be ignored. It has more leverage than ever.

### **Where Now for Civil Society and the WTO?**

Civil society must now seize this unique chance, this breathing space which may last for around a year, to change the WTO and the global economy for good. It must move from *opposition to proposition*, demanding reform not only of the process - which clearly needs fundamental democratisation — but also the substance of the WTO and its many agreements. Civil society must make it absolutely clear that the cosmetic solutions proposed by the EU's Trade Commissioner and others - a little more transparency, consultation, and technical support for developing countries - are grossly insufficient.

Instead, a unifying programme for wholesale change must be developed and campaigned for that trims from the WTO every rule that threatens the ability of people - through their governments — to protect their environment, health, livelihoods, food security, cultural diversity, and democratic and human rights. In order to further the ability of people to achieve these goals, the WTO must also be reformed to *promote*, rather than undermine, strong local economies - in other words, *reversing* its current role.

### **Building Alliances for Change**

Developing such a programme for change will entail maintaining, strengthening and extending alliances across social sectors, North and South,

through new dialogues. In particular, the South needs to be assured that such a programme is in the interests of its citizens - unlike continued economic liberalisation and export-led growth. That goal may entail rejecting the idea of using the WTO to *impose* global labour and environmental standards, a task, where appropriate, that is better left to the agencies of the UN by providing them with binding powers - comparable to those of the WTO - to do so.

But the WTO would still need to be reformed so that it does not *undermine* such standards wherever they exist. If the governments of the South can be persuaded on these points, civil society may well find in them powerful allies, as they too emerged strengthened from Seattle, able for the first time to exact a high price for their future cooperation. Many also share the goal of revising WTO agreements and procedures, and of resisting further WTO expansion.

If such a unifying programme for reform can be developed, civil society must then hold the governments of the US and the EU to their word. In Seattle and its aftermath, they promised to include social and environmental concerns in future deliberations: now they must deliver. And not just with regard to the WTO, but the IMF and the World Bank as well - and any other back-door bilateral or regional attempts to fulfil similar agendas.

If they do not, they should know that they will face more opposition than ever, not least from a new generation of young people radicalised by Seattle. At each important upcoming economic event, such as the meeting of the IMF on April 16 in Washington D.C., and US Congressional debates on granting China "Most Favoured Nation" status as a prelude to its accession to the WTO, they will face growing resistance.

Public Citizen's Lori Wallach argues it should be a "fix it or nix it" campaign. Accordingly, if by the time of the next WTO Ministerial meeting, governments have failed to agree to the reforms demanded by civil society and are still peddling the same expansionist agenda as in Seattle, which they may well do, not only will that meeting face Seattle-scale demonstrations, but campaigns are likely to be launched to end countries' funding and membership of the WTO.



## Seizing the Moment

Seattle achieved what has never been accomplished before: it exposed the world trading system to the sunlight and as a result it will never be the same again. How different it will be, though, depends on the ability of NGOs and citizens throughout the world to maintain suffi-

cient pressure on their governments to make wholesale reform a political necessity. The significance of the challenge is clear. As leading Indian activist Vandana Shiva says, this is "the most important democratic and human rights struggle of our time." It will not be easy, but Seattle has created a unique and historic *opportunity* for real change. *Now* is the time to seize it.

# International nongovernmental organizations and the globalization of victimhood

by Peter A. Mameli\*

*The emergence of a new, class of victims is the dark underside of the phenomena being called globalization. Today's victims are not drawn solely from the lower economic classes of society. In varying degrees, they exist in all classes. As we move into the twenty-first century, it is of increasing importance that we begin to envision how, the forces of globalization and its victims will interplay and effect the future of governance. The relationship between nation-states, the international economy that relies so heavily on these weakening organizational forms for support, and the ability of people across the globe to develop a human-centered social consciousness that becomes empowered through the expansion of international nongovernmental organizations is of critical importance to study in concert now.*

## The road we are on

In recent years, the study of globalization has become of central concern to many scholars.<sup>1</sup> One ongoing problem in this area of study has been establishing a working definition for the term globalization. As Harris notes:

*Terminology in this whole area seems designed for obfuscation.*<sup>2</sup>

A basic definition is provided by Arthur MacEwan and describes the phenomena as:

*The international spread of capitalist exchange and production relationships.*<sup>3</sup>

W  
h  
i  
l  
e  
t  
h  
i  
s  
  
d  
e  
f  
i  
n  
i  
t  
i  
o  
n  
  
d  
o  
e  
s  
  
e  
x

pose some of the

powerful players and structures at the heart of the globalization explosion (capitalists and capitalism), it doesn't completely cover the matter. David Held and Anthony McGrew offer deeper insight with the following comments:

*On the one hand, the concept of globalization defines a universal process or set of processes which generate a multiplicity of linkages and interconnections which transcend the states and societies which make up the modern world system: the concept therefore has a spatial connotation. On the other hand, globalization also implies an intensification in the levels of interaction, interconnectedness or interdependence between the states and societies which constitute the modern world community.*<sup>4</sup>

Many of these writers have made significant headway in coming to terms with what globalization in fact is, yet, they have not sufficiently touched on the notion that a new class of individuals is being created who are a direct result of the negative effects of its processes. Capitalists and nation-state power elite are identified as the practitioners, and essentially the winners, of globalization. However, few people seem terribly concerned with losers in this experiment and what directions they might be heading in.

\*Associate Professor,  
John Jay College of  
Criminal Justice,  
Department of Public  
Management

prnamefi@jay.cuny.edu

1. See Schott, T. Collaboration in the Invention of Technology: Globalization, Regions and Centers." *Social Science Research*, 23, 1994, pp 23-56; Krasner, S. D. "International Political Economy: Abiding Discord." *Review of International Political Economy*, 1:1, Spring 1994, pp 13-19; Storper, M. "The Limits to Globalization: Technology Districts and International Trade." *Economic Geography*, 1992, pp 60-92; Thrift, N. "Muddling Through: World Orders and Globalization." *The Professional Geographer*, volume 44, No. 1, 1992, pp 3-7; and Riggs, R. "Globalization - An Inquiry About Meaning." *PA Times*, October 1999, for a few examples.

2. Harris, R.G. "Globalization, Trade, and Income." *Canadian Journal of Economics*, V.26, November 1993: p. 757.

3. MacEwan, A., Stagnation." *Monthly Review*, Volume 45.No.11, April 1994, p. 1.

4. Held, D and A. McGrew, "Globalization and the Liberal Democratic State,"

28, Spring 1993, p. 262. *Transnational Associations* 2/2000, 56-59

Globalization has increased the mobility of people, capita], ideas and technology around the world in the last quarter century. It has also brought with it the increased impoverishment of many groups and individuals. Imbalances in the flow of global public goods, and the uneven power structure of the current system of nation-states, is creating a new class of victims who are not solely defined by traditional economic or territorial characteristics. Indeed, this growing class of victims has qualities that cut across economic categories, and characteristics that penetrate nation-state borders as well as race, ethnic and gender boundaries. The resulting globalization of victimhood is being established through processes that allow for continuous environmental degradation, disease transmission, food, water and mineral exhaustion, human rights violations and much more. Reaction to these conditions presents a fundamental (although fledgling) human-centered challenge to the current nation-state and capitalist based global hegemonic order that is finding expression in the expansion of international nongovernmental organizations designed to address these needs.

Of particular importance to the shaping of an emerging class of victims is the inability and/or unwillingness of existing nation-states and their power elite to effectively cope with modern crises that directly impact this population. The continued failure of parties in power to meet the needs of victims in these areas is leading to the birth of a new human-centered consciousness, multi-dimensional class structure and global counter-hegemonic bloc among disaffected people that is being voiced through international nongovernmental organizations which at least try to provide the services nation-states fail to.

This globalization of victimhood is not being defined simply by the vertical characteristics economic classes have been identified with in

the past (i.e., being layered on top of each other in the self-contained units of an upper, middle and lower class). Nor is it being defined by the spatial boundaries of nation-states, or the longer standing separations associated with gender, race and ethnicity. Instead, this global class of victims is multi-dimensional in appearance, drawing members from all elements and levels of existing societies. One additional birthmark of the twenty-first century's class of victims is that they will not be exclusively concerned with the relationship between economics and politics. There is an ever-increasing integration of ecological interests into the considerations of victims, as it is these conditions that often are having a more directly identifiable impact on their impoverishment.

### Gramscian theoretics

Antonio Gramsci used Marx based concepts of hegemony, historical material blocs and dialectics to weave his theory of politics and political change.<sup>5</sup> Gramsci's ideas hold particular relevance for this analysis as he provided a theoretical gateway into understanding how new social movements and class structures can appear, develop and become fully actualized within an existing global society and hegemonic apparatus to which disadvantaged populations are denied access. Despite Gramsci's focus on economic determinants in class development, his ideas still hold relevance for theories that seek to explore changing class dynamics stretching beyond these parameters.

The term hegemony is generally accepted as implying a dominance of social, cultural and political leadership, but hegemony is more complicated than this definition leads one to believe. Gramsci believed that counter-hegemonies of subaltern or working class groups also existed. These counter-hegemonic blocs sought to replace the current dominant ruling order with a hegemony of their own. Additionally, there were variations on the expression of hegemonic power.

For Gramsci, multiple hegemonies and counter-hegemonies could be taking place in the relationship between the state and civil society at any given time - and within all levels of the

social structure. Gramsci noted that hegemonies and counter-hegemonies existed among intellectuals, classes and nations.<sup>6</sup> Each hegemonic and counter-hegemonic group was described as forming their own distinct historical material bloc.<sup>7</sup> Historical materialism has been defined as:

*Asserting the causal primacy of men's and women's mode of production and reproduction of their natural physical being, or of the labour process more generally, in the development of human history.*<sup>8</sup>

Hollow social hegemony (my term) is the type of hegemony that Gramsci indicated was exercised by the historical material bloc of the dominant ruling class. Hollow social hegemony uses cultural manipulation within civil society to reinforce the rule of repression applied by the state apparatus. Gramsci's description of what amounts to a solid social hegemony (again my term) entails the overarching consent of civil society and is spawned from a union of proletarian and peasant interests managed by revolutionary parties that represent a subaltern historical material bloc. These hollow and solid forms of social hegemony are in a constant condition of dialectical tension for Gramsci, and represent an ongoing struggle for control of the means of production.

Exchanges of power (as well as the general interaction that Gramsci depicted) between hegemonic and counter-hegemonic groups in any setting were described as unfolding along the lines of a dialectical, historical procession. That is to say, the existence of a hegemonic power bloc necessarily led to the creation of a counter-hegemonic bloc, which in turn could eventually displace the current leadership.<sup>9</sup> It is important to point out that Gramsci did not see the result of power transition as a necessary conclusion to dialectical processes. Dialectical development of a society could result in such a power shift, or remain stagnant with the actors staying in place, or even devolve into chaos. A changing of the guard, so to speak, was never to be taken for granted.<sup>10</sup>

Gramsci discussed "wars of maneuver" and "wars of position" as being means through which the subaltern class could attempt to overthrow the existing hegemonic order of the bourgeois state, and its reinforcing cultural structures in

5. Gramsci, A. *Selections from the Prison Notebooks*. Edited and translated by Q. Hoare and G.N. Smith. International Publishers, New York, 1971.

6. Gramsci, *Prison Notebooks*, pp 5-14, 176 and 177.

7. Gramsci, *Prison Notebooks*, pp 60, 61, 74, 168 for several relevant cites.

8. Bashkar, R. in A *Dictionary of Marxist Thought*. Bottomore, T., L. Harris, V.G. Kiernan and R. Miliband eds., 1983: p 324.

9. Gramsci, *Prison Notebooks*, pp 109- 110.

10. Gramsci, *Prison Notebooks*; see discussion on Caesarism, pp 219 - 222.

civil society.<sup>11</sup> The first strategy called for direct confrontation with the current hegemon's apparatus of physical control. The second initiative advocated what amounts to a winning of civil society's various hearts and minds prior to any attempt to dislodge the reigning state and class frameworks (resulting in a solid social hegemony if successful).

A key element in achieving success of any kind would be through the creation of a subaltern class of "organic intellectuals," who would lead a counter-hegemonic force to a solid social hegemony, organic intellectuals were the product of the class they were born into, and were loyal to its interests. From the ranks of the organic intellectuals loyal to the working class and peasantry, the "modern prince" would emerge to lead a counter-hegemonic bloc of resistance against the ruling class. Organic intellectuals were the antithesis of the "traditional intellectuals" who Gramsci saw as coopted from all classes to do the bidding of the currently dominant hegemonic power.<sup>12</sup>

Traditional intellectuals served to prop up hollow hegemonic control of society through the furthering of what Gramsci termed a "passive revolution." The term passive revolution refers to an inundating of societal, cultural and political norms with the dogma of the hollow hegemonic class so that all inconsistent or revolutionary thought becomes virtually unachievable.<sup>13</sup> To Gramsci, if those in charge of these sectors at the "superstructural level" (i.e., the state and civil society) became welded into a broad coalition that reinforced each other's positions and excluded the workers and peasants, something of a hollow social juggernaut would appear.<sup>14</sup>

### The globalization of victimhood

Conceptualizing the roles that the nation-state and the current international liberal economic order have played in the past, and the roles that they will continue to play in the future, is key to imagining how the globalization of victimhood can further develop in the years to come. Conversely, imagining continuing changes to this emerging population is vital to mapping the future of international politics, globalization

processes and concepts of social justice Gramsci's views on society can help us to address these needs. At the present time, however, imagination is being restricted.

The international system continues to perform attuned to past visions of men like Niccolò Machiavelli, Thomas Hobbes and Adam Smith who perceived, and imparted to the world, theories of political realism and economic liberalism. Upon these foundations of thought, nation-state sovereignty, competitive capitalism and a world order have been fashioned. While standing atop these pillars however, one can also see the imbalances in the international system, and the negative impacts of increasing globalization that can cause their erosion.

The enduring pull of this state-centric logic remains strong, having become so ingrained in public discourse that it is very difficult to shake off. The sovereign nation-state and its ability to restrict, separate and contain a human-centered (global) social consciousness is a concept still granted primary status in many respects where international affairs are considered. Any approach to understanding, explaining and even changing the international system from this posture exhibits an acceptance of a relative "truth" regarding the worlds perceived political and economic leanings. That truth being nation-states, tied to liberal economic systems, are the overpowering historical fact of modern world politics even if dialectical elements of social change are present within them. This perspective gives short shrift to theories and concepts of human-centered consciousness, and the power they possess to alter the current path we travel by constructing and empowering international nongovernmental organizations while establishing new networks of interaction.

In the modern international arena, theoreticians and practitioners of realist based politics and liberal economics have bonded together over time to create a passive revolution of thought that is ultimately, now, a hollow hegemonic order that discounts the marginalized countries of the nation-state system and those individuals on the outskirts of the world capitalist economy. This globalized condition however, does not simply stop at victimizing those on the outskirts of world society. Across all levels of

11. Gramsci, *Prison Notebooks*, pp 108-110.

12. Gramsci, *Prison Notebooks*, pp 5 - 23.

13. Gramsci, *Prison Notebooks*, pp 58 - 59.

14. Gramsci, *Prison Notebooks*, pp 12 - 13 for a discussion of superstructures.

society, globalization's negative consequences can claim victims. What is consistently missing when reviewing globalization is discussion of the resulting imbalances that create a wide range of victims, and also the ability and on-going efforts of this population to throw off the yoke of global victimization through human-centered activities.

Envisioning a dialectically driven world where globalization's winners and losers continue to impact each other in a fashion that makes history resonate with the possibility of *fundamental* change conjures new opportunities. It can also help in the stabilization of an international political system that will be required to manage the impact of these developments.

Victims of international crises ranging from the HIV/AIDS pandemic, to various forms of environmental degradation, to human rights violations born out of the structural violence of the nation-state system, represent a force that does not have to take shape within the controlling parameters of existing nation-states or classes. The victims of these crises are often indiscriminately chosen from throughout the human population and are fundamentally at odds with the current political and economic structures of international affairs. As such, a new power base is potentially being born in the global arena that is slowly being expressed through its own, international nongovernmental, organizational structures.

Due to their current lack of cohesion, we are only beginning to imagine what a global class of victims and their resulting organizational milieu

might fully look like in the twenty-first century. Similarly, the relevance and impact of this population on the international political system of the next century is still being conceptualized as well. In spite of the current power of the nation-state system, and the world's liberal capitalist economy we have become all too comfortable with in the last 200 years, it is entirely appropriate to begin envisioning alterations to this structure now, as change to the system is already underway. Focusing on issues of human survival and ecological necessity in conjunction with political and economic concerns can become the next step in understanding the roads that might be traveled by this haphazardly growing class of global victims.

Conditions are ripening for the creation of just such a cohesive global web of disenfranchised and disparate interests to take form. After all, if globalization can lead to the interlocking of political and economic elite worldwide through the disbursement of people, capital, ideas and technology, why not its victims as well? Indeed, since globalization's victims come from all levels of society, some of the public goods successfully used by winners are indeed available to losers. Should performance shortcomings among nation-states continue to grow in regard to victim's interests, true organic intellectuals will emerge and this class will have the opportunity and means to both envision and actualize even broader international nongovernmental structures and organizations than exist today in order to fill this void.

# The landmine ban and NGOs: the role of communications technologies

by Ken Rutherford\*

*"[T]he involvement of civil society and the information technology revolution are the foundations on which a profound democratization of international politics is being built"* Statement by Lloyd Axworthy, Canadian Foreign Minister, to the NGO Forum on Banning Anti-Personnel Landmines, Oslo, Norway, September 7, 1997.

## Introduction

With the broader independent bases of public support that NGOs command, they were better able to target banning landmines long before governments were ready to do so, propose most of the precepts of a formal ban landmine treaty, and mobilize public pressure to force through a weapons prohibition that virtually no one thought possible when the International Campaign to Ban Landmines (ICBL) was formed in 1992. The ICBL encompasses more than 1000 NGOs from both developed and developing states and is loosely organized in a global campaign to ban landmines that was able to bridge deep North/South differences among governments. Many expected that North-South differences would block an agreement as is typical with most multilateral arms control treaties. United in passionately alleviating the effects of the anti-personnel landmine use, the ICBL members were able to effectively utilize communications technologies to disseminate information to each other, the media, their respective governments and the public, which, in turn, generated government support for a landmine ban. Most importantly, communications technologies allowed NGOs to discuss contentious subjects among themselves, and then to take an agreed upon position to their respective government delegations. As a result, the Ottawa Convention to Ban Anti-Personnel Landmines was negotiated, signed and entered into force faster than any other major treaty in the world's history. Moreover, it is the first multilateral arms control treaty that was not supported by the major powers and the first disarmament treaty that bans a weapon already in widespread use. This chapter contends that communications technologies facilitated the landmine ban movement, especially in the latter years of the campaign. These technologies allowed ICBL members to disseminate research widely and, in most cases, publicize information quickly to

influence state landmine policies toward banning landmines. Furthermore, these technologies allowed the ICBL to communicate and coordinate among themselves and with the governments, media and public in a quickly and cost effective manner. Finally, these technologies reduce coalitional building costs, especially among southern NGOs, and allow for information collection and dissemination in an issue area once monopolized by states, namely security. This chapter concludes that the ICBL's effective application and utilization of communications technologies provides a model for future NGO coalitional building and strategies toward working with or against state interest.

In a span of less than fifteen months, profound and rapid change in state perception toward landmine use resulted in the Ottawa Treaty banning anti-personnel landmines.<sup>1</sup> This paper examines how the International Campaign to Ban Landmines (ICBL)<sup>2</sup> utilized communications technologies to help achieve the treaty against the backdrop of two basic questions: How Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs) and communications technologies interacted to influence the creation of norms at the heart of state sovereignty — weapons? In addition, what are the larger policy and theoretical implications this campaign and the role of communications technologies may have on international relations? Thus, this paper is an empirical case study of how the ICBL utilized communications technologies in order to achieve the ban, and what are the broader implications for international relations. This paper fills this gap by providing an empirical case study on an issue that has received much attention, but ironically relatively little analysis. There is no question, however, that the ICBL was very effective in achieving their landmine ban goal as evinced by the signing of the Ottawa Treaty by more than one-hundred and thirty states,<sup>3</sup> and its entry into force faster than any arms control treaty in the worlds history.

\*Southwest Missouri State University, Assistant Professor Political Science email: krrphd@aol.com Fax: (703) 522-1371 Tel: (703) 522-6609

1. Officially known as The Ottawa Convention on

the Prohibition of the Use, Stockpiling, Production and Transfer of Anti-Personnel Mines and on their Destruction.

2. The Campaign consists of over 1000 arms control, development, environmental humanitarian human

rights, medical and religious NGOs representing some 70 countries.

3. In a survey conducted during the December 1997 treaty signing conference, a majority of governmental officials participating in the Ottawa Treaty negotiations felt that their state signed the treaty because of the NGOs, Ekos Research Associates, Inc., "Ban Convention on Anti-Personnel Mines" Government Representative

While International NGO policymaking entrepreneurial skills and lobbying strategies, such as promoting their messages through the media, taking public protesting actions, and mass letter writing campaigns are well-known in other international issue-areas, such as the environment and human rights, the landmine ban case exhibits relatively new communications technological strategies to advertise their message and reduce coalitional building and maintenance costs. These recent technologies are one of the major factors in the rise in NGO power on the landmine issue. This chapter focuses on these newer strategies by applying them to the landmine ban campaign, which is one of the first transnational movements that actively integrated and utilized communications technologies to achieve its goals. In particular, it examines how the ICBL incorporated communications technologies in their activities to achieve an effective campaign.

The study of how the ICBL utilized communications technologies is important to international relations because it highlights how a coalition of NGOs helped achieve a ban on a weapon in widespread use and in opposition to the major world powers for the first time. Moreover, it also shows how the ICBL used communications technologies to successfully prod the international community to pay attention to the landmine issue that ultimately led to a majority of states banning a weapon retaining military utility.

The chapter is organized in two sections. The first section addresses the ICBL and the role communications technologies in the landmine campaign in three areas: 1) Quick information analysis and provision; 2) Constructing, creating and maintaining a virtual organization; and 3) Building trust and transparency. The second section examines the larger policy and theoretical implications that this campaign may have on international relations. It concludes that the ICBL use of informational technologies portends new avenues by which informational technologies can be used to influence foreign policymaking. One of the chapter's broader implications is that the landmine campaign highlights the changing relationship between states and NGOs. Finally, it also discusses implications that can be drawn from the landmines campaign

for other NGO coalitions attempting to influence foreign policymaking.<sup>4</sup>

## Part one: the ICBL and the role of communications technologies

Since the end of the Cold War, state sovereignty has continually been challenged by NGOs concerned with transnational problems that states have been unable or unwilling to manage. Because of the need for coordinated international action on these problems, the increasing ease of instant communication has helped increase interstate communications and "expand the number of NGOs at the global level as well as their role in multilateral diplomacy."<sup>5</sup> In other words, the rapid development of communications technologies have helped transform NGOs into important international actors that have the ability to influence international politics. As Jessica Mathews, President of the Carnegie Endowment for Peace recently stated "[t]hese technologies have broken governments' monopoly on the collection and management of large amounts of information and have taken away from governments the deference that they enjoyed because of that monopoly."<sup>6</sup> Collaborating this observation are a "growing number of other scholars and analysts who also point out that breakthroughs in telecommunications and transportation have undermined state authority by ending the state's monopoly on information; that there is an increasing reliance on nonstate entities such as NGOs for focus and direction, drafting, and implementation of declarations, platforms, and treaties on crucial international issues, including human rights, the environment, and the proliferation of land mines."<sup>7</sup> The potential implications are that these technologies are allowing NGOs greater power in issues traditionally monopolized by states.

Historically, states have excluded NGOs from the security issue area. Countering state arguments for maintaining landmine as a viably legal option, the ICBL was able to begin infringing on state control of the weapon agenda with communications technologies. From the very beginning of the campaign, ICBL members produced extremely solid analyses to support the case for a mine ban and refute specific arguments raised by states. One of the leading Canadian Government negotiators,

4. Since the awarding of the 1997 Nobel Peace Prize to the ICBL, new NGO coalitions have formed to address other international issues, such as banning child soldiers, restricting small arms and light weapons, and ratifying the criminal court.

5. JoAnn Fagot Aviel, "NGOs and International Affairs: A New Dimension of Diplomacy," in James P. Muldoon, Jr., JoAnn Fagot Aviel, Richard Retiano, and Earl Sullivan, eds., *Multilateral Diplomacy and the United Nations Today* (Westview Press: Boulder, 1999) p. 156.  
6. Statement by Jessica Tuchman Mathews to the 75<sup>th</sup> Anniversary Symposium, Harvard School of Public Health, Boston, MA. <  
<http://www.hsph.harvard.edu/digest/mathews.html>>  
September 25, 1999.

7. Richard Retiano and Caleb Eifenbein

Robert Lawson, stated that NGOs were critical to the success of the treaty's achievement because they were especially helpful "in bringing the issue from the field to foreign capitols."<sup>8</sup>

## I. Quick information provision

### A. Introduction

The ICBL's ability to provide quick and reliable information during the UN CCW negotiations in 1995 and 1996 laid the groundwork for diplomatic and public disenchantment with the UN negotiating forums and for pressure to create an alternative negotiating forum that could achieve a landmine ban in a relatively short period of time. Cooperative information exchange between the ICBL and states eventually led to an alternative diplomatic avenue, led by the Canadian Government in 1997, to ban landmines resulting in a breakthrough from the UN weapon negotiating forums.<sup>9</sup>

In conclusion, the ICBL used communications technologies during this period as a way to initiate and prod the international community toward paying attention to the landmine issue. Surprisingly, the ICBL only used basic communications technologies, such as the telephone and fax, during this time-period. It did not emphasize e-mail or web page technology as a communication tool until later in the campaign.

The ICBL initiative and effort in the early 1990s ultimately led to state action toward banning a weapon in widespread use for the first time. They effectively competed with states to control and move the landmine issue on and up the international political agenda by providing faster and higher quality information than states were able to produce, analyze and address. Consequently, the ICBL members became essential participants in a process that they helped initiate by participating in landmine conferences and treaty drafting. The ICBL became indispensable to this process because they could provide informational and lobbying power that states could not ignore. Even during the consensus and state based United Nations (UN) negotiating forums of the CCW, NGOs became firmly established at all landmine conferences because of the wealth and quality of the

landmine information that they were able to provide states.<sup>10</sup>

### B. Media technologies

The ICBL's utilization of media technologies also greatly contributed to moving states toward the landmine ban position. It had the technical ability to research and publicize information quickly and early enough in the agenda setting process of international conferences to affect state landmine policy development. By controlling the agenda - what was to be discussed and how - the ICBL established the context of the landmine debate as humanitarian rather than military. The ICBL utilized communications technologies to disseminate information concerning the effects of landmine use to the attention of the international community, other ICBL members, the media, their respective governments and the public. This effort greatly influenced the landmine positions of many states, especially Canada. Canadian Foreign Minister Axworthy commented that states can no longer "ignore the power and reach of new information technologies that allow the experience of Angola and Cambodia to be brought into people's living rooms."<sup>11</sup> Axworthy's implication is that these technologies allow for information collection and dissemination in an issue area once monopolized by states, namely security, and in far away places to be brought to the public and their governments.

During the ICBL's early years it encouraged the media to focus on the victims as a way to garner wide and intensive attention. As the victim novelty angle of the landmine story wore out, the media continued to focus on the illegality of the weapons. Soon, "one by one, major media sources in almost all regions of the world began to endorse the concept of a global ban on AP mines."<sup>12</sup> This was a planned strategy on the ICBL's part as it decided very early in the movement to develop "several traveling photograph exhibits and videos" to highlight the horrible consequences of landmine use to policymakers and the general public.<sup>13</sup> In one notable case, during 1997 campaigners "traveled 7500 miles across the USA in five weeks to raise awareness about landmines by giving over 1000 presenta-

8. Statement by Robert Lawson, Government of Canada, to the Workshop on Ratification and Implementation of the

Mine Ban Treaty, Regional Conference on Landmines, Budapest, Hungary, March 27, 1998. Report: Regional Conference on Landmines, International Campaign to Ban Landmines, Budapest, Hungary, March 26-28, 1998, p. 53.

9. *Ibid.*, p. 31.

10. Williams and Goose, in Cameron, et al, p. 31.

11. Statement by Lloyd Axworthy, Canadian Foreign Minister, to the

Anti-Personnel Landmines, Oslo, Norway, September 7, 1997.

12. Williams and Goose, p. 23.

13. Lora Lampe and Jeff Donarski, *The Arms Trade Revealed: A Guide for Investigators and Activists* (Federation of American Scientists: Washington, D.C., 1998) p.86

14. Statement by John Rosted, ICBL Photographer, to the Panel Presentation and Discussion "Campaigning: Launching National Campaigns, Using the Media, Public Awareness Raising, Coalition Building, and Direct Acción," Regional Conference on Landmines, Budapest, Hungary, March 27, 1998. Report: Regional Conference on Landmines, International Campaign to Ban Landmines, Budapest, Hungary, March 26-28, 1998, p. 65.



15. *Ibid.*, p. 65.

16. *Ibid.*, p. 66.

17. Williams and Goose pp. 24-25.

18. ICBL pamphlet, "So you want to lobby decision-makers?," May 1999, p. 7.

19. Williams and Goose, p. 24.

20. Mary Wareham, former USCLB Coordinator and current Senior Researcher at Human Rights Watch, quoted in Tom Price, "A Lever to Move the World,"

Foundation for Public Affairs, October 7, 1999, p. 7.

21. Francis X. Clines,

"28-Year Quest to Abolish Land Mines Pays Off for Veteran. Who Fights On," *The New York Times*, December 3, 1997, p. A10.

22. Peter Golding,

"Worldwide Wedge: Division and Contradiction in the Global Information Infrastructure," in Daya

Thussu, ed., *Electronic Empires: Global Media and Local Resistance* (London: Edward Arnold, 1998), p. 145, quoted in Oliver

Boyd-Barrett, "Trends in World Communication," *Global Dialogue*. Volume 1, Number 1, Summer 1999, p. 58.

23. Engardio, p. 145.

24. International Campaign to Ban Landmine Web Site, [www.icbl.org](http://www.icbl.org). The ICBL organized task forces to focus on particular issues such as demining, victim

assistance, and universalization of the treaty.

25. Recorded notes from workshop discussion on Using the Campaign as a Model for Other Issues," at the NGO Forum, Oslo, Norway, September 7, 1997 in the *ICBL Report: NGO Forum on Landmines*, Oslo, Norway, September 7-10, 1997, p. 31.

26. Pete Engardio, "Activists Without Borders," *Business Week*

tions to audiences in over 75 cities."<sup>14</sup> During the trip, they "operated a mobile media center using a lat top computer with modem, mobile telephone and digital camera to record each days events and email back to the broader US campaign with daily updates recorded on the campaign's web site."<sup>15</sup> In late 1997, a similar Ban Bus program took place in Belgium.<sup>16</sup>

### C. E-mail communications

The ICBL was also able to utilize a few communications technologies across a range of dissemination and communications strategies, especially in the later years of the campaign. Initially, the ICBL internal communications framework utilized telephones and faxes machines. It was more than five years into the campaign (in 1996) that e-mail became a more widely utilized communications tool as the primary method for ICBL leaders to coordinate strategies among its members. These leaders emphasize that e-mail communications are primarily used for internal ICBL communications rather than "for communications outside of the campaign."<sup>17</sup>

Since the objectives for external communications were different from those for internal communications, they were used differently, the ICBL emphasized other communications tools. E-mail communications to government policymakers was also encouraged by the ICBL as an appropriate form of "contact," but not a major part of the lobbying strategy.<sup>18</sup> While the importance of e-mail communications may have been integral to ICBL communications during the later years of the campaign, it "alone did not 'move the movement.'"<sup>19</sup> External communications primarily emphasized personal lobbying, such as "banging on the doors of everybody on a regular basis" was also a major part of the campaign in bringing governments on board.<sup>20</sup> Bobby Mueller, Executive Director of Vietnam Veterans of America Foundation (VVAFF) and one of the ICBL's co-founders disparages any notion that e-mail communications significantly helped achieve the treaty. He commented that "[t]here is so much romanticized gobbledegook going on out there today about people clattering away on E-mail and moving the world on this issue [landmines]. Nonsense. This is basic politics 101. It's political strength. It's money."<sup>21</sup>

One of the reasons that recently developed communications technologies, especially e-mail and web sites, did not make a significant difference in the ICBL's initial communications strategy is that many NGOs and governments did not have access to them or were just learning how to use them. Some of even the most basic communication technologies, such as the telephone are out of reach of many of the worlds population, many of whom live in landmine infested states. According to a 1998 publication, for example, "[h]alf of the world's population had never made a phone call."<sup>22</sup> Internet communications penetration of the public, of course, is much lower. In the United States, the "[p]ercentage of Americans online has risen from 14% to 41% in three years" by October 1999.<sup>23</sup> It was not until several years later that the ICBL began promoting communications technology as a major communications and lobbying tool, and encouraged new members to get on-line. By 1999, the ICBL web site provided registration materials to members and visitors for more than five separate e-mail list groups ranging from media landmine news updates to campaign news, including the differing ICBL task forces.<sup>24</sup>

### D. Web pages

Another form of communications technology that the ICBL utilizes in its campaign is web pages. These pages help provide the media and interested public and policymakers with information on a 24-hour basis and easy access. It also helps to generate governmental respect for the ICBL.<sup>25</sup> Moreover, web sites greatly enhance the ability of NGOs to compile central information and make it available rapidly to activists. More specifically, it allows for individuals working from their homes and/or private locations to pressure governments.<sup>26</sup> Beyond being an information source for governments, members and the media, the sites also provide the public with a source for updated landmine information. Most of these sites are hyper-linked to each other thereby increasing total 'hits' or Visits.' These websites are currently also being used by the ICBL members for fundraising and marketing purposes.

ICBL utilization of the web as a tool for fundraising and marketing parallels the overall trend in the NGO world. In the later part of

27. Shannon Henry, "Charity Begins Online: New Sites Ease Consumers' Research into Philanthropies," *Washington Post*, October 20, 1999, p. E1.
28. Quoted in Henry, p. E1.
29. Henry, p. E4.
30. *Ibid.*, p.44.
31. ICBL pamphlet, "So you want to order resources on landmines?," May 1999, p. 2-9.
32. Telephone conversation with Marissa Vitagliano, Coordinator, U.S. Campaign to Ban Landmines, VVAF, October 19, 1999.
33. Telephone conversation with Mary Wareham, Senior Researcher, Human Rights Watch and former Coordinator, U.S. Campaign to Ban Landmines, October 19, 1999.
34. *Ibid.*
35. *Ibid.*
36. Authors investigation, September 1996.
37. ICBL pamphlet, "So you want to order resources on landmines?," May 1999, pp. 10-11.
38. Telephone conversation with Mary Wareham, October 19, 1999.
39. ICBL pamphlet, "So you want to plan and evaluate your campaign?," May 1999, p. 3.
40. *Ibid.*, p. 4.
41. "Tireless Activist on Shoestring Budget: Nobelist runs global campaign out of her house," *San Francisco Chronicle*, October 11, 1997.
42. Ken Rutherford, "The Evolving Arms Control Agenda: Implications of the NGO Anti-Personnel Landmines," paper presented at the 1999 American Political Science Association Annual Conference, Atlanta, Georgia, September 5, 1999.

1999, for example, charity web-sites started to proliferate.<sup>27</sup> According to Daniel Langan, director of public information for the National Charities Information Bureau, "[t]he Internet is the future charitable giving"<sup>28</sup> by encouraging more charities to go on-line to research funding opportunities and keep up to date with the non-profit and NGO communities.<sup>29</sup>

Web site fundraising, for example, is currently being conducted effectively by the Zapatista National Liberation Army fighting the Mexican Government for Chiapas self-rule. It has raised hundreds of thousands of dollars using the Internet.<sup>30</sup> While it is still premature to judge the influence of ICBL web fundraising, visitors to the ICBL and many other ICBL member web sites can donate or purchase campaign materials from the web sites. For example, by May 1999, the ICBL listed twenty-eight landmine publications available by more six websites.<sup>31</sup>

Similar to the results from external e-mail communications, the benefits of using the web were at best minimal. The ICBL did not have a web site until March 1996,<sup>32</sup> when VVAF donated some of its organizational web site pages to the ICBL in the capacity of housing the USCBL campaign coordinator.<sup>33</sup> This initiative came in part from Mary Wareham, the United States Campaign to Ban Landmines (USCBL) Coordinator from 1995 to 1998, who wanted a few pages to store the USCBL and ICBL web site. Only afterwards did the major organizations in the ICBL start acquiring web sites.<sup>34</sup> At the time, there was very little landmine web site information, except for a UN Department of Peacekeeping Operations web site,<sup>35</sup> which itself provided outdated and unreliable information.<sup>36</sup> Soon obtaining individual organizational web sites addressing the landmine issue became very popular among ICBL members. By May 1999, for example, there were more than 25 major landmine sites recommended by the ICBL as sources of further information.<sup>37</sup> It was only in early 1998 that the ICBL created their own website, which is maintained in Oslo, Norway by a young Norwegian webmaster, Kjell Knudsen, hired by the ICBL.<sup>38</sup>

In early 1999, the ICBL started to encourage people interested in starting a landmine ban campaign in their own countries or researching

more about landmine information to visit its website in order to educate themselves about the landmine issue.<sup>39</sup> More importantly, they could investigate the landmine situation in their own countries by addressing such questions as: 1) Does your country produce and/or export APMs?; 2) Has your country signed/ratified the Mine Ban Treaty?, and, 3) Are there many victims and survivors of mine injuries eg. ex-military or people living in certain parts of the country?<sup>40</sup>

## E. Conclusion

These media, e-mail and web site technologies allow for NGOs to mobilize quickly in response to state actions or international events as warranted. This follows along the lines of a "war room" strategy that allows for quick and repeated counter attacks to any actual or potential threat to a core value. In other words, by utilizing information technologies, NGOs are better able to provide information in a quickly and timely fashion in order to diminish State control of information to the media and public, and other governments. The ICBL Co-ordinator, Jody Williams, for example, usually rose around 4 AM to work the computer to send e-mail instructions to ICBL members and in response to recent events.<sup>41</sup>

The ICBL case also shows how NGOs capitalizing on communications technologies are able to address international issues very quickly and move it onto and along the international political agenda.<sup>42</sup> Perhaps the broader implication is that "the most fundamental aspect of globalization is the pervasive compression of time and space, affecting the way we think, feel and act, introducing speed and proximity as defining attributes of our daily human experience."<sup>43</sup> The speed of the Ottawa Treaty's development is in contrast to past diplomatic attempts to address issues, which usually entail years and decades to resolve issues.

Solely crediting the Internet for the successful creation and initiation of the landmine ban movement and the achievement of the Ottawa, however, is not completely accurate. When the ICBL was created in 1991 the Internet was not a familiar or utilized communication tool until several years later into the campaign. The lack of

43. Richard Falk, "The Montheistic Religions in the Era of Globalization," *Global Dialogue*, Volume 1, Number 1, September 1999, p. 139.

44. Williams and Goose, p. 24.

45. *Ibid.*, p. 20.

46. Statement by Richard H. Stanley, President, The Stanley Foundation, at the Opening of "The United Nations and Civil Society: The Role of NGOs," 30<sup>th</sup> United Nations

Conference, February 19.

1999. Quoted in the *United Nations and Civil Society: The Role of NGOs: 30<sup>th</sup> United Nations Issues Conference 1999*

(Muscatine, Iowa: Stanley Foundation, 1999) p. 7.

47. Engardio, p. 145.

48. *Ibid.*, p. 144.

49. Lumpe and Donarski, p.86.

50. Recorded notes from workshop discussion on "Usina the Campaign as a Model for Other Issues," at the NGO Forum, Oslo, Norway, September 7, 1997 in the *ICBL Report: NGO Forum on Landmines*, Oslo, Norway, September 7-10, 1997, p. 30.

51. ICBL pamphlet, "So you want to plan and evaluate your campaign," May 1999, p. 7.

52. Statement by Ann Peters, Landmines Project, Open Society Institute, to the Panel Presentation and Discussion "Campaigning: Launching National Campaigns, Using the Media, Public Awareness Raising, Coalition Building, and Direct Action,"

Regional Conference on Landmines, Budapest, Hungary, March 27, 1998. Report: Regional Conference on Landmines, International Campaign to Ban Landmines, Budapest, Hungary, March 26-28, 1998, p. 66.

e-mail use in the early years is more reflective of the low rate of Internet availability and use among society as e-mail and other Internet technologies were just coming on-line. Therefore, during the early years of the campaign (1991-late 1995) relied on extensive use of telephone and fax communication technologies. Because fax technology was relatively new in the early 1990s, "it was 'exciting'" and since the "[i]nformation arriving almost instantaneously by fax was perceived to be more important - and thus more deserving of an immediate response — than regular mail."<sup>42</sup> E-mail communications became more important later in the campaign as the technology became available and, most importantly, when the ICBL broadened its focus from the Western states, many of whom produced mines, to Southern states, where most of the landmines are located. ICBL members began to use e-mail communication more frequently until the switch fully occurred in late 3995 and early 1996.<sup>45</sup>

## 2. Virtual organizations: reducing coalitional building and maintenance costs

### A. Introduction

Recently international political commentators claim that NGOs have proliferated in recent years because of "the revolution in information and communications technology."<sup>46</sup> In the case of the ICBL pursuing the landmine ban we have seen above how these technologies allowed it to disseminate information widely and quickly. This section will discuss how these technologies were utilized in constructing the ICBL as a "vertical organization." This paper uses the definition of vertical organizations as "unstructured ad hoc clusters of people who perhaps never met" but share a sense of common passion and quickly mobile for political action.<sup>47</sup> In addition to helping the ICBL construct its organization, these technologies help it to maintain a unified and cohesive coalition, which entailed communicating and coordinating strategy among a wide variety of NGOs in more than seventy states. The role of communications technology in developing a virtual organization will be dis-

ussed below in two parts: 1) Reducing coalitional building costs; 2) Reducing communications costs.

### B. Reducing coalitional building costs

These technologies have also help NGOs reach out to each other across geographical space.<sup>48</sup> Broadening the membership base was deemed by ICBL leadership as an essential priority in order to achieve a nearly universal ban. One of its strategies was to generate more public pressure on states through continual membership expansion by either supporting the creation of new country landmine ban campaigns or attracting existing NGOs to join. The ICBL's creation of a wide ranging coalition with wide ethnic, geographical, organizational and religious diversity was one of the campaign's major accomplishments. Most of this credit should go to the ICBL leaders who "did a fantastic job of identifying opportunities to advance the campaigns goals and alerting to its global network of supporters through newsletters, e-mail, [and] the web."<sup>49</sup>

While communications technologies greatly assisted ICBL leaders in building the coalition, the more important implication for their role in international relations is that they help to significantly reduce coalitional building costs, especially among southern NGOs. More importantly, these technologies allowed the ICBL to expand quickly and effectively to southern states at a minimal cost. Such expansion truly helped to create "a global movement rather than North Atlantic dominated" and helped provide guidance and enhanced data collection and dissemination by regional campaigners.<sup>50</sup> Furthermore, the establishment of regular newsletters and e-mail list was deemed important for building landmine ban alliances and coalitions.<sup>51</sup>

After the treaty signing, the ICBL encouraged newly forming national landmine ban campaigns to begin with informational technology tools, such as e-mail address, in order to be connected to the campaign. Some of the funding for these technologies came from the Landmines Project at the Open Society Institute, which supported communications technology procurement for NGOs.<sup>52</sup> The ICBL, for example, donated to many start-up national campaigns

"access to a computer" in which they could begin to write press releases, contact the media and public...activities that can begin without many financial resources.<sup>53</sup> As a way to help jump start the landmine ban campaigns in Russia and the Caucasus region, especially Chechnya and Abkhazia, the ICBL was asked to help build up "a basic infrastructure for [the] mine campaigns" through "concrete" means, such as "help with getting basic communications like telephone, email, computer, etc."<sup>54</sup>

### C. Reducing communication costs

In addition to helping the ICBL reduce coalition building costs, these technologies also helped reduce the costs associated with communications. Communications technologies helped ICBL members overcome geographical separation among the ICBL members, who come from more than seventy different states, and government control of information at a lower cost than traditional forms of communications. These technologies were especially important to the ICBL in 1997 as more southern NGOs joined the campaign and as the early December treaty signing date neared. While the traditional forms for communication, such as telephone, faxes and mail, were instrumental in the ICBL's formative years, it required a tremendous amount of time and money. Once established on the Internet, ICBL leaders were able to send more information in a less amount of time at a cheaper cost through e-mail. During the initial phase of the campaign, for example, in 1992 and 1993, Jody Williams, the ICBL Coordinator, would take meeting minutes and talking points by her laptop computer, then disseminate them by fax and then later by e-mail.<sup>55</sup> Moreover, the web site informed members of campaign activities negating the need for further ICBL correspondence. Once utilized, geographical distance no longer matters as much as when information technologies were logistically challenging and financially burdensome to allow individuals and NGOs to communicate on a regular basis across borders and regions. In sum, these technologies dramatically reduced the communication costs for southern NGOs to participate as an active ICBL member.

It also enabled Northern NGOs to incorporate southern NGOs into the decision-making process. ICBL leaders observed that in late 1995 and early 1996, when e-mail "became established within the ICBL, its lower costs and increased reliability relative to telephone and fax made it particularly important in facilitating communication with campaigners in developing nations."<sup>56</sup>

Moreover, the relatively low cost of e-mail communications and collecting data and ICBL updates from the Web provided the ICBL with an avenue for helping to assist Southern Landmine Ban Campaigns in a low-cost fashion. In turn, this provided the southern NGOs from most of the worlds most heavily mined areas with an inexpensive avenue to provide field data to northern NGOs, whom, in turn, disseminated it to governmental representatives, the media and the public.

Another related point is that Internet technologies also allowed these NGOs operating in countries with authoritarian governments to avoid and circumvent Government controls and censorship over traditional media outlets, such as newspapers and television. It is more difficult for governments to control Internet technologies from being utilized by their citizens and from communications originating from foreign soil. These technologies weaken governmental monopolies on informational control and dissemination. It has also "eroded the deference governments enjoyed because of that greater knowledge."<sup>57</sup>

## 3. Building transparency and trust

### A. Introduction

Communications technologies also greatly broaden the range of contact points for NGOs, governments and the public to meet. Some international relations scholars argue that communications technologies are one of the major reasons for the globalization of world politics. They believe that these technologies help facilitate the de-coupling of various international activities from fixed geographical locations and hence issue control by governments.<sup>58</sup> The NGO role in building transparency and trust among themselves and with states and international

53. Statement by Liz Bernstein, ICBL Co-Coordinator, to the Panel Presentation and Discussion "Campaigning: Launching National Campaigns, Using the Media, Public Awareness Raising, Coalition Building, and Direct Action," Regional Conference on Landmines, Budapest, Hungary, March 27, 1998. Repon: Regional Conference on Landmines, International Campaign to Ban Landmines, Budapest, Hungary, March 26-28, 1998, p. 59.  
54. Conference Action Plan, Regional Conference on Landmines, Budapest, Hungary, March 27, 1998, p. 74.

55. Caryle Murphy, "The Nobel Prize Fight," *Washington Post*, March 22, 1998, p. F4.

56. Williams and Goose, p. 24.

57. Jessica T. Matthews, "Are The Networks Better Than Nations?" in James M. Lindsay, ed., *Perspectives: World Politics* (Coursewise Publishing: Chicago, 1997) p. 7.

58. Maarten Smeets, "Globalization: Threat or Promise?" *Global Dialogue*, Volume 1, Number 1, Summer 1999, p. 11.

59 Leon Gordenker and Thomas G. Weiss, "Pluralizing Global Governance: Analytical Approaches and Dimensions," in Thomas G. Weiss and Leon Gordenker, eds., *NGOs, The UN, and Global Governance* (Boulder: Lynne Rienner, 1996) p. 35.

60 Maxwell A. Cameron, Roben J. Lawson, and Brian W. Tomlin, "To Walk Without Fear," in Cameron, et al., p. 5.

61 Robin M. Coupland and Adrian Korver, "Injuries from antipersonnel landmines: the experience of the International Committee of the Red Cross," *British Medical Journal*, December 14, 1991, pp. 1509-1512; *The Arms Project Human Rights Watch and Physicians for Human Rights, Landmines: A Deadly Legacy*, October 1993, pp. 117-140.

62 Robin M. Coupland and Remi Rutschbach, "Injuries from Anti-Personal Mines: What is Being Done?," *Medicine and Global Survival*, Volume 1, Number 1, March 1994, pp. 18-22.

63. *Ibid.*, pp. 261-318.

64. Statement by Ken Rutherford, Observer for the International Rescue Committee, to the Review Conference of the Convention of Conventional Weapons, Vienna, Austria, September 28, 1995.

65. *Ibid.*, p. 124.

66. Williams and Goose, p. 24.

67. *Ibid.*, p. 23.

68. Tom Price, "A Lever to Move the World," *Foundation for Public Affairs*, October 7, 1999, p. 7.

organizations, such as the UN, is enhanced by informational technologies. These technologies allow international actors to facilitate transnational, -geographical, and — cultural relationships with governments, including soliciting state reaction and responses to be inputted back into social movements, such as NGO campaigns. In transnational coalitions "it is natural that a web of informal links develops to confront issues defined in the formal structure."<sup>59</sup>

### *B. Facilitating coordination among ICBL members*

A major challenge for the ICBL was keeping diverse composition of its membership on the same page. The ICBL's "handful of key full-time and paid activists" utilized fax machines and the Internet in order to help connect the more than 1000 NGOs representing more than 70 states making up.<sup>60</sup> While human rights, medical and human rights NGOs all had differing reasons for banning landmines, their landmine ban activities required coordination in order to achieve their common goal of a landmine ban. The medical NGOs targeted landmines because their field medical staffs complained that landmine injuries, on average, require more blood units and repeated surgical care than other munition injuries.<sup>61</sup> The extensive medical requirements that landmine injuries require, puts another burden on an already stretched medical infrastructure in many developing countries where landmines are present.<sup>62</sup> Human rights NGOs complained that since landmines are indiscriminate and in proportionate to their military utility, they violate the international humanitarian legal rights of civilians.<sup>63</sup> Lastly, development and refugee NGOs complained that landmines negatively affect their ability to transport relief supplies into infested areas and that once the conflict settles, landmines are an impediment to refugee repatriation, state reconstruction and development.<sup>64</sup>

The ICBL experienced differences among its members as is normal with large, diverse communities. To explain how the ICBL community was organized, we need to look at its origination. It developed through an exchange of information among NGOs operating in mine-infest-

ed states and looking for common way to solve the landmine problem. The cultivation of organizational and governmental contacts through conferences, face to face meetings and other informal forms of meetings, eventually brought them on board the ICBL's common theme: Ban Landmines. The common, yet specific goal, made the ICBL unique as compared to many other transnational movements that have a diverse agenda.

While this singular policy goal helped to keep the coalition from becoming too unwieldy and disparate, informational technologies greatly facilitated the ICBL's coordination. Coordination was extremely important in convincing states that there was a civil society movement afoot to ban landmines. Herein lies the key ICBL characteristic that differs it from other transnational movements — central coordination. In most social movements, an unwieldy coalition leads to policy fragmentation and begets instability.<sup>65</sup> In contrast, through person to person meetings and meetings a conference, and continual reinforcement by e-mail, web sites and group lists allowed ICBL members to develop into a relatively close-knit community. If these technologies were lacking, the ICBL's decentralized structure could have collapsed under mis-communication and coordination problems. These communications were central ICBL element because a range of groups from different countries and serving different organizational constituencies directed them. The ICBL leaders also believe that "the ease and speed of communication within the ICBL provided by e-mail clearly had a great impact on the ability of civil society organizations from diverse cultures to exchange information and develop integrated political strategies."<sup>66</sup>

Internal communications among ICBL members was regular and communicated by and through the co-ordinator, Jody Williams. Her regular communication provided NGO "members with a sense of the overall activities of the campaign, which "was key to the creation and maintenance of the momentum of the ICBL."<sup>67</sup> Put otherwise, ICBL's utilization of inexpensive communication technologies was a good counterweight to fragmentation among members. According to the former USCBL coordinator, coordination was the key to the ICBL, and that the Internet

was the "main organizing tool" for its "communications network."<sup>68</sup> That is not to say that there were not philosophical and personal divisions within the ICBL, because there were. The claim here is that these technologies favor NGO coalitions to coordinate among themselves at the international level vis a vis hierarchical power structures that does not require a "physical or formal institutional presence."<sup>69</sup> E-mail communications were especially crucial in "planning of major activities and conferences, such as those held in Cambodia in 1994 and Mozambique in 1997."<sup>70</sup> For example, the ICBL June 1995 Cambodia Conference was the first international landmine conference held in a landmine infested country and the first conference organized "primarily through e-mail."<sup>71</sup> The main point here is that Jody Williams and other ICBL leaders maintained the ICBL on a straight and clear path to accomplish its goal of banning landmines by utilizing the fax machine, and then later relying on e-mail communications to coordinate among the members.<sup>72</sup>

### C. Following through on commitments

Serving at the center of the movement to ban landmines, the ICBL was the main drivers and coordinators of the strategy to ensure a comprehensive treaty. The utilization of e-mail lists by ICBL coordinators in Oslo also allowed them to communicate with numerous member NGOs, media and governmental officials in a quickly and efficient manner about the treaty's progress. More importantly, it allowed the ICBL to coordinate and direct action in many states in order to hold diplomats negotiating the treaty to commitments made by their governments.<sup>73</sup> In other words, it made state behavior at the conference more transparent. One result is that if states know their behavior is being observed, they are more likely to follow through on their commitments.

A specific example of how ICBL members coordinated among themselves in response to the state landmine policies, were their activities during the 1997 Oslo Treaty signing conference in September. To ensure states abided by their commitments, ICBL activists at the Oslo conference used e-mail to communicate with national campaigns to contact and lobby their governments

about certain critical issues and policies being discussed at the treaty negotiations. These campaigns, in turn, communicated back to the ICBL coordinators in Oslo with updates regarding their government positions.<sup>74</sup> For example, Australians lobbied their Government in Canberra, when informed by ICBL activists that they "heard the Australian delegation was supporting an effort to create a big loophole."<sup>75</sup>

The implication is that various diplomatic and lobbying practices, such as vague commitments and double-speak, no longer hold and can be disaggregated by NGOs utilizing informational technologies. Furthermore, key NGO diplomatic and lobbying functions can be coordinated and performed in different geographical locations, thereby ensuring a nearly universal monitor on governmental behavior. Put otherwise, the ICBL case evinces that the tyranny of diplomatic secrecy regarding information and challenging geographic barriers can be overcome through strategic utilization these technologies.

### C. Communication Opportunities

Communications technologies also help build transparency and trust by providing increased access and opportunities to communicate directly with governments. Making it easier for NGOs and governments to communicate encourages cooperation and understanding. Building trust and transparency with governments via Internet communications however is difficult. E-mail communications from the ICBL to many governments was not emphasized for several reasons. First, many governments, especially those in the South, lacked e-mail technology. It was not just southern governments that lack that ability to communicate by e-mail as some governments in northern states did not have that capability either.<sup>76</sup> Therefore, the ICBL lobbied via telephone, fax and personal visits.

Second, even if some governments had e-mail capability, their Internet systems were limited to internal or inter-governmental correspondence rather than external correspondence. The lack of capability to communicate with the ICBL could be due to a range of reasons. Some diplomats did not want to be accountable for their written correspondence via e-mail - which could then be dis-

69. Statement by Jessica Tuchman, September 25, 1999.

70. Williams and Goose, p. 24.

71. *Ibid.*, p. 30.

72. James Bandler,

"Laureate in a minefield," *The Boston Globe Magazine*, June 7, 1998, p. 28.

73. Price, p. 7.

74. Telephone interview with Mary Wareham, Senior Researcher, Human Rights Watch, and former coordinator of the U.S. Campaign to Ban Landmines, October 12, 1999.

75. Price p. 7.

76. Telephone interview with Mary Wareham, October 12, 1999.

77. Interview with Ann Peters, Director, Landmines Project, Open Society Institute, Washington, D.C. October 5, 1999.

seminated to an activist subscriber network, while their governments discouraged outside e-mail correspondence for political and security reasons.

Third, some diplomats who had e-mail capability simply preferred telephone conversations and some minimal fax correspondence rather than utilizing e-mail. The diplomats may have been wary of communicating through such a public forum as the Internet and therefore wanted to narrow the range of prospective leaks and/or minimize their exposure. During the early stages of the campaign, when states were not rapidly endorsing the ban, some diplomats exhibited great courage and tenacity in bringing their own states own board. At times, some of these diplomats felt more kinship with the ban coalition forces than their own government.<sup>78</sup> These diplomats had the conviction and drive with acute sense of political responsibility toward banning landmines and therefore felt a moral obligation to the ICBL and other governmental personnel committed to banning landmines. The implication is that some diplomats may have wished to protect their views from their government's scrutiny and therefore conducted negotiations in a most secretive manner that is not conducive to communicating via networks. Moreover, there were many face to face meetings to discuss substantive issues that negated the need for substantive dialogue via e-mail. Most other issues could be handled by telephone or fax.<sup>79</sup>

The Ottawa Process working group was not unwieldy, because it comprised a few state and ICBL negotiators, therefore also negating the need for intensive e-mail communications. The prelude to each of these conferences and meetings entailed "intensive telephone and fax diplomacy through which common objectives were established and tactical approaches developed.<sup>80</sup> Moreover, at these conferences and meetings, the ICBL had tremendous up front and agenda-setting input in addition to "a seat at the table as a full participant."<sup>81</sup>

#### 4. How states may control NGO use of informational technologies in their efforts against the campaign

Before the advent of the technological revolution, and economic and social interdependence,

most governmental policies were largely immune from the influence of NGOs. However, while informational technologies had an effect on the international level and in Western states, for several reasons it was not as an important factor in the internal landmine politics of non-Democratic states and non-Western states. Put otherwise, informational technologies had a greater effect on the landmine policies of democratic states rather than non-democratic states. For several reasons, informational technologies had limited impact in the South Perhaps the most important reason is that there is a lack of political pluralism in many non-democratic states, "lobbying groups aren't as prevalent."<sup>82</sup> Therefore, only the collective pressure brought by the ICBL as an international coalition and pro-ban states with economic and political influence in bilateral and multilateral lending agencies could influence the political leaders of these states.<sup>83</sup>

Another factor hindering the effectiveness of informational technologies in the South was the language barrier among regional states and in the ICBL itself, whose main working language was English. Even among states in the same region, there were language barriers that hindered communications. In Africa, for example, regional cooperation utilizing informational communications was "slowed by language barriers that make landmine awareness campaigns both difficult and expensive."<sup>84</sup>

Lastly, while [a]dvances in technology may have broken the state's monopoly on information...the coercive potential of regime-sanctioned violence often undermines criticism and opposition.<sup>85</sup> Many non-democratic governments can take active measures to cut down on NGO utilization of informational technologies, even though they may not be able to control Internet activity. Governmental security personnel "can seize computers or cut Web access. In 1999 the Chinese Government, for example, temporarily shut e-mail service at domestic Internet service companies in a clampdown on Falun Gong," a secretive religious sect.<sup>86</sup>

While communications technologies may not have the same significant impact in non-democratic states that they had in democratic states, this situation may no longer be sustainable.

78. Author notes taken from diplomat's remarks at the Ottawa Process Forum, Ottawa, Canada, December 3, 1997.

79. Robert J. Lawson, Mark Gwozdecky, Jill Sinclair, and Ralph Lysyshyn, "The Ottawa Process and the International Movement to Ban Anti-Personnel Mines," in Cameron, et al. p. 168. 80. Williams and Goose, p. 35.

81. Ibid., p. 35.

82. Engardio, p. 150.

83. Statement by Dr. Walter Odhiambo, International Physicians for the Prevention of Nuclear War (IPPNW) to the "Creating and Strengthening a Campaign" panel at the First International Conference on Landmines in Russia and the CIS, Moscow, May 27, 1998, in IPPNW-ICBL Report on the First

*Landmines in Russia and CIS: New Steps For A Mine Free Future* (Boston: IPPNW, 1999) p. 41.

84. Ibid., p. 42.

85. Reitano and Flifenbein, p. 237.

86. Engardio, p. 150.

87. T.R. Reid, "Britain Concedes In Virtual Battle: Internet List of Alleged Spies Multiplies," *Washington Post*, May 15, 1999, p. A17.

88. 1998 *Hidden Killers: The Global Landmine Crisis*, United States Department of State, Bureau of Political-Military Affairs, September 1998, pp. 8-9, and 11.

89. Falk, p. 139.

90. Ekos Research Associates, Inc., "Ban Convention on Anti-Personnel Mines: Government Representative Focus Group," as part of the *A Global Ban on Landmines: Survey of Participants*, Technical Report, December 22, 1997, p.1.

91. Statement by Jessica Tuchman Mathews, September 25, 1999.

92. *Ibid.*

93. See Margaret E. Keck and Kathryn Sikkink, *Activists beyond Borders* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1998); Martha Finnemore, *National Interests in International Society* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1996).

94. Paul Wapner, "Politics Beyond the State: Environmental Activism and World Civic Politics," *World Politics*, 47, April 1995, p. 311.

95. George Gallup International Institute, "The Health of the Planet Survey," quoted in "Bush Out of Step, Poll Finds," *Terra Viva: The Independent Daily of the Earth Summit* (Rio DC Janiro, June 3, 1992, p.5, quoted in Wapner, p. 324.

These technologies have been especially difficult for governments, whether democratic or non-democratic, to control. They may yet prove to be out of any government's control. Recently Great Britain's intelligence service assess that "the Internet is so fast and so far-flung that no government can control the flow of information on the global network.<sup>87</sup>

## Part two: implications

As communication technologies continue to develop and come on-line, and increasingly become available to the public, the result for international policymaking will be profound. This paper shows how informational technologies facilitated ICBL communications and reduced its networking costs. More these technologies also helped the ICBL maintain a unified and coordinated campaign and broadened it to more than seventy states. Understanding the ICBL utilization of informational technologies is important because highlights implications for international relations and future NGO coalitional efforts to address transnational issues. Furthermore, Landmines are a key policy problem, as they are the cause of many injuries and deaths in regional conflicts, hinder post-conflict reconstruction, seriously undermine infrastructure, and deny land to civilian use thereby leading to overuse of existing land.<sup>88</sup> Therefore, current NGO coalitional efforts to ban child soldiers, restrict small arms and light weapons, and ratify the international criminal court may be able to better utilize informational technologies based on the ICBL's experience. In particular, there are several implications that can be gleaned from the ICBL case: 1) Hierarchical disruption; 2) Larger and broader NGO coalitions addressing specific issues; and 3) Creation of international law.

### A. Hierarchical Disruption

One implication from the ICBL's use of communications technologies is that the rise in its influence relative to state power in creating and developing the Ottawa Treaty evinces that states need information and services that NGOs can

provide. These technologies are allowing a "revolutionary control over information" to dominant international politics.<sup>89</sup> Furthermore, governmental negotiators should learn to become team players with NGOs, rather than remain isolated in a state centric process. In a survey conducted the day after the treaty signing, a majority of governmental officials participating in the Ottawa Treaty negotiations felt that "the role of NGOs throughout the process as invaluable and atypical with respect to the high degree of NGO and government cooperation."<sup>90</sup>

The policy implication is that communication technologies can increase the transparency of governmental decision-making and behavior and open them up a better-in formed public, which could result in governments working with NGOs rather than trying to monopolize policymaking themselves. Importantly, "the information and communications revolution distrupts hierarchies by diffusing and redistributing power."<sup>91</sup> According to some international scholars, new transnational communications structures now better allows for NGOs to draw the attention of publics across borders. Such access to domestic populations has allowed NGOs to slowly diminish the primacy of the State - citizen relationship. Increasingly, governments must now contend with domestic public opinion "on matters that have traditionally been handled strictly between governments."<sup>92</sup>

While scholarly work has shown how NGOs can make a difference in state policies on a range of international issues,<sup>93</sup> it has mostly been developed in the research programs investigating NGO influence in environmental politics. Paul Wapner, for example, has shown that during the 1980s, studies have shown that environmental NGOs have influenced international negotiations of the environmental protection of the oceans, the ozone layer and Antarctica.<sup>94</sup> NGOs also increased public pressure on governments to protect the global environment as evidenced from a poll taken in 1981, when "forty-five percent of those polled in an U.S. survey said that protecting the environment was so important that requirements and standards cannot be too high and continuing environmental improvements must be made regardless of cost; in 1990, 74 percent supported the statement."<sup>95</sup> While



the environmental issue is different from landmines, because the latter lies at the heart of state sovereignty - weapons, it shows that NGOs can have an effect on state behavior. These technologies gave the ICBL greater flexibility to change and address time-sensitive issues than governments because they were better able to mobilize and act quickly than governments. In an era of rapid political and technological change, it also gave the ICBL added strength in working with and against states. The Canadian diplomats leading the landmine ban negotiations and Ottawa Process also point out that the treaty evinces how NGOs can rapidly organize to address and solve issues, and that coupled with "the new tools of the Information Age" they are tremendously important in any state's diplomatic tool-kit.<sup>96</sup>

### B. Collective Voice

Another implication that can be drawn from ICBL use of communications technologies is that it shows how NGOs and work together to speak with one voice. As communications technological continues, NGOs are more able to developed broader based coalitions. Especially important is that these technologies provide cheaper, easier and reliable communications between Northern and Southern based NGOs. The ICBLs ability to capitalize on developing information technologies to communicate and mobilize as one collective voice against landmine use made it a very effective international force. The ICBL model of mobilizing NGOs and working with small and mid-size states to ban landmines can form the basis for a new international "superpower."<sup>97</sup> One day after being awarded as co-recipient of the Nobel Peace Prize, Jody Williams stated that "[f]rom day day one we [the ICBL founding members] recognized that instant communications was critical...It made people feel they were part of it."<sup>98</sup>

Progress in this area will help increase NGO capabilities in the future to develop larger and universal coalitions. These technologies may result in a "fundamental transformation of the nature of politics," which, according to Juan Enriquez, a Harvard University expert on Latin America, generates "very tightly knit communities that are not geographically contiguous."<sup>99</sup>

The landmine case shows how informational technologies, especially E-mail and the Web, helped the ICBL reduce transnational coalition building costs and increased international media exposure. These technologies also help bridged the all too familiar north-south NGO divide that provide damaging to so many other NGO efforts, such as the Nuclear Non-Proliferation Treaty (NPT).

### C. Cross-Cultural Tool

The landmine case also evinces new avenues by which communications technologies can be used to bridge geographical and cultural differences. This trend is likely to continue as more people look to the Internet as the primary source of their information and use it as one of their main communications tools. Already this change can be seen in the United States, where in 1996 "Republican Presidential candidate Bob Dole tried - with little success - to get voters to check out his web site" while in 1999 "45% of likely Republican primary voters with a computer say the Internet is 'the place they go for information' about politics."<sup>100</sup> Recent gains in communications technologies have subsequently allowed international NGOs greater flexibility in conducting restricted one to one communication. This trend is expected to grow, especially to non-Western states. In Latin America, for example, there are currently "[s]ome 1 million people [that] have Web accounts, not including many who get free access. Latin American users are expected to grow to 19 million by 2003."<sup>101</sup>

In sum, coupling communications technologies with NGOs working co-operatively through coalitions, such as the ICBL, give them access to a broader audience thereby creating a more informed public. In sum, these technologies helped facilitate the ICBL in expertise in raising issues of international concern "and the organization of that expertise into networks of knowledge-based relations among the worlds peoples."<sup>102</sup>

### Conclusion

The arguments outlined in this paper address the broader question of agency in world politics

96. Roben J.Lawson, Mark Gwozdecky, Jill Sinclair, and Ralph Lysyshyn, "The Ottawa Process and the International Movement to Ban Anti-Personnel Mines," in Cameron, et al. p. 163. 97. Williams and Goose, p. 47. 98. Quoted in Dana Priest, "U.S. Activist Receives Nobel Peace Prize for Land Mine Campaign: Home-Based Effort, Via Computer, Led to International Ban Treaty," *Washington Post*, October 11, 1997, p. A20. 99. Engardio, pp. 144 and 150. 100. *Ibid.*, p. 148. 101. *Ibid.*, p. 150. 102. J. Marshall Beier and Ann Denholm Crosby, "Harnessing Change for Continuity: The Play of Political and Economic Forces Behind The Ottawa Process," in Cameron, et al. p. 272.

103. Statement by Tore Skedsmo, Chief, United Nations mine Action

Service to The Landmine Symposium of American University's Center for Global South, Washington, D.C., April 6, 1999.

104. Ibid.

105. Statement by Mr. Choi, United Nations [position not titled] at the Special Committee on Peacekeeping Operations, April 1, 1999.

106. Statement by Tore Skedsmo, Chief, United Nations Mine Action Service, James Madison University, Harrisonburg, Virginia, October 5, 1998.

107. Chair's Summary,

"Years, Not Decades: Agenda For Mine Action II, Mine Action Coordination Workshop, Ottawa, Canada, March 23-24, 1998, pp. 29-32.

108. Coalition to Stop the Use of Child Soldiers, <http://www.child-soldiers.org/> October 29, 1999.

109. Ibid., [http://www.child-soldiers.org/coalition\\_and\\_its\\_supporters.htm](http://www.child-soldiers.org/coalition_and_its_supporters.htm), October 29, 1999.

110. Liz Clegg, "NCCOs Take Aim," *The Bulletin of the Atomic Scientists* 55 (January/February 1999), p. 49.

111. The International Action Network on Small Arms (IANSA) - Founding Document, May 1999, p.1.

112. The International Action Network on Small Arms (IANSA), <http://www.iansa.org/> October 29, 1999.

113. Ibid.

by showing how communications technologies facilitated ICBL pressure on states to address the landmine issue in a particular way that eventually culminated in an international treaty banning landmines. This theoretical implication suggests that the landmine case illustrates how communications technologies helped the ICBL facilitate a landmine ban norm and translate it into a powerful instrument with lasting influence. Since explaining the role of informational technology in the ICBL's efforts to ban landmines provides a better understanding of its role in propelling the emergence of the landmine ban norm, it provides a helpful theoretical framework for understanding the construction of new norms in other issue areas, such as humanitarian intervention, the use of force, and environmental issues. Moreover, it may also help predict the success or failure of current NGO efforts to create new norms, such as banning the use of child soldiers, restricting the use of small arms and light weapons, and ratifying the international criminal court. The broader implication of this study is that under certain conditions informational technologies can help NGOs contribute to creating international legal rules, which in turn can effect state behavioral changes. The implication evinces how NGOs can utilize communications technologies to control, set the international political agenda, and sustain a broad international social movement toward reaching its goal. This case shows that the future of communications technologies influencing international politics has arrived. Today's international political arena is more interconnected through communications technologies, and therefore more affected by world transfers of information. This paper has provided an empirical analysis explaining ICBL's use of informational technologies in achieving its success.

In the future, these technologies will continue to play an important role in alleviating the effects of landmine use and, more importantly, helping to implement the Ottawa Treaty provisions. The United Nations, for example, is currently utilizing these technologies to ensure "the incorporation of data on mine awareness education and mine victim assistance into the information management system for mine action

(INSMA), on which UNMAS [United Nations Mine Action Service] is cooperating with the Geneva International Centre for Humanitarian Demining."<sup>103</sup> It is also working with UN agencies, such as World Health Organization (WHO) and UNICEF, in developing "a comprehensive landmine injury data/surveillance system which will standardize information collection."<sup>104</sup> Third, the United Nations is also using communications technology to coordinate "assessment missions and resource mobilization, and is responsible for information management and technical safety standards."<sup>105</sup> For example, the first draft of the "International Standards for Humanitarian Mine Clearance Operations" developed by an UN-led working group was placed on the Internet in September 1998.<sup>106</sup> The importance of information, such as gathering, collating, evaluating, analyzing, and integrating information needs to be done effectively for it to help alleviate the mine problem.

Informational management systems are critical to achieving this goal. The development of landmine informational management systems, however, has led to many opposing and overlapping projects, organizational involvement and lack of coordination. Less than five months after the treaty signing in December 1997, for example, there were more than twenty-eight informational databases in operation or under development, including six at the United Nations.<sup>107</sup>

The ICBL model of utilizing communications technologies to strengthen the campaign provides a model that could be useful in current and future efforts at changing state behavior toward certain issues. For example, The Coalition to Stop the Use of Child Soldiers is currently attempting to attach an optional protocol banning the recruitment of child soldiers to the Convention on the Rights of the Child.<sup>108</sup> Its website lists the steering group members from more than eleven states, provides a site location encouraging organizations to join the campaign, and offers links and database for further information.<sup>109</sup> The ICBL model also provides the basis for another effort, the International Action Network on Small Arms (IANSA),<sup>110</sup> which is concerned with restricting the proliferation of small arms.<sup>111</sup> The Campaign is composed of NGOs organized in

the wake of the Ottawa Treaty signing. Its website provides action alerts directing supporters to express their concerns directly to particular governmental representatives through their e-mails, which are provided.<sup>112</sup> It also provides an opportunity to join the campaign, research further information about the campaign, and an area to read the latest campaign news.<sup>113</sup>

The most significant aspect of the ICBL case, is that it shows how NGO coalitions can use communications technologies in order to increase their opportunities for success in changing state behavior. It highlights the importance how NGOs might be able to address security and social issues that states have thus far proven unable to manage. While a tremendous amount of financial and human resources went into producing the landmine ban, in the near future, there will be new issues whose effects will be similar to the humanitarian devastation caused by landmines but perhaps the international community is not willing to provide the required resources. Communications technologies have an important role to play in reducing costs associated with such campaigns and they may help NGOs had better organize themselves into a coherent and focused campaign. Also important is that they can help NGOs identify these issues earlier in the process so that they can be addressed before they become a major international problem. Moreover, if NGO coalitions are going to go to the excess every time of calling for changing state behavior, especially in the face of state opposition, then utilizing communications technologies is critical to bringing attention to the issue and then increasing public pressure on states to change, control, or stop their behavior.

The landmine case provides a prologue to future NGO attempts at changing state behavior in certain issue-areas. While e-mail and web-based communications technologies were not instrumental in launching the ICBL or its lobbying efforts during the early years, the ICBL increasingly relied on them as the campaign expanded to the south and as technologies developed to ensure reliable and cheaper communications. These technologies are now helping aid the ICBL in monitoring the treaty.

Unique to the Ottawa Convention is an external effort by the ICBL to evaluate the international response to the landmine situation. Specifically, five NGO members of the ICBL are conducting the Landmine Monitor Program to help implement and enforce the treaty's provisions.<sup>114</sup> This program is the first systemic effort by NGOs to monitor and report state compliance with an arms control and international law convention.<sup>115</sup> One of its goals is to make available a continuous flow of high-quality research and analysis on state landmine activities and policies in order to monitor the implementation of the treaty. The Landmine Monitor information is available on-line through the ICBL web site.<sup>116</sup> One can read the executive summary, and full and country reports. Moreover, the since the program is on-going, it is also recruiting researchers through the web site.

In conclusion, the role of communications technologies in future international social movements and transnational NGO coalitions will become more important. While communications technologies continue to be important to the ICBL, the Internet based communications technologies were not emphasized until much later in the campaign. Internet communications technologies late contribution to the ICBL's lobbying efforts can be attributed to its late adoption by many governments as a communications tool and that lack of technological expertise and resources among many ICBL members. Furthermore, some governments were also not yet comfortable or willing to use the Internet to communicate with external parties, such as the ICBL and its members. Instead, personal lobbying, through face to face meetings and telephone calls, proved essential in initiating and establishing productive relationships among many NGO representatives and state negotiators. Subsequently, communications technologies significantly contributed to reducing a range of communications coalitional building costs, especially with NGOs from Africa and Asia. Finally, communications technologies greatly facilitated state confidence building that the ICBL could quickly deliver public support and provide expert information.

March 29, 2000

114. While the Landmine Monitor program is coordinated by Human Rights Watch, Handicap International, Kenya Coalition Against Mines, Mines Action Canada and Norwegian People's Aid, the research was conducted by "in-country researchers utilizing the ICBL's network of 1,300 non-governmental organizations working in over 80 countries." *ICBL press release*, May 3, 1999, "Landmine Monitor Report 1999: Toward a Mine-Free World."

<http://www.icbl.org/>  
115. ICBL press release, October 1, 1998, "Mine Ban Movement Accelerates Into New Phase."

<http://www.icbl.org/>  
116. *Landmine Monitor Report 1999*, <http://kbl.org/lm/1999/>

# Religion at the Millennium

By Edward Goldsmith\*

*"The Millennium coincides with a widespread yearning for individual and Earth healing. Individuals and societies, global and local, and the whole Earth community suffer as never before under unsustainable human impact. The healing ministry should be broadened to include the earth, the living soil, plants animals water and climate, and the science and technology which, when arrogantly misused, threaten the very continuation of our species and the biosphere as we know it."*

Edward Echlin

Three years ago, at a meeting on a ship chartered to us to Patmos, where St. John wrote Revelation, his holiness the Metropolitan John of Pergamon declared that environmental destruction must be regarded as a sin. It was encouraging to see dignitaries from the Church of England and Roman Catholicism immediately concur - as, in fact, did Hindu, Jain and Zoroastrian speakers. But none of them may have realised the full implications of this declaration: it was in effect an indictment of our modern industrial society itself.

Indeed, the destruction of the natural world, which is proceeding at an ever greater pace, is the inevitable consequence of the whole enterprise to which modern industrial society is so wholeheartedly committed: with 'progress' - in other words, economic development - its dominant feature. This process has rarely been defined, but it involves, above all, the systematic substitution of the world of commodified human artefacts - the surrogate world - for the natural world - the real world - the product of 3,000 million years of biological and ecological evolution.

There is another problem with the notion that to "destroy the environment is a sin". People may pay lip-service to it, but it will only sink into their psyche, and its many implications be accepted and acted upon, if it is reconcilable with the world-view with which they have been imbued. This is true with everybody, whether they be pavement artists, theologians or scientists - though the latter claim that they only accept a proposition as constituting scientific knowledge if it has been verified (or falsified) in controlled laboratory conditions. In fact this is an illusion, for verification or falsification serve to do little more than rationalise, and hence legitimise, beliefs that have been acquired by intuition - which in fact are those that best fit in with our paradigm on the subject it reflects and

hence our world-view. To quote Michael Polanyi, the great philosopher of science: "The test of proof or disproof is in fact irrelevant for the acceptance or rejection of fundamental beliefs, and to claim that you strictly refrain from believing anything that should be disproved is merely to cloak your own will to hide your beliefs behind a false pretence of self-critical severity."<sup>1</sup>

## Science as religion

Mainstream scientists, like everybody else, will do everything they can to preserve their paradigm or worldview in the face of knowledge that appears to undermine it, and hence will reject any propositions that conflict with it. The idea that to destroy the environment is a sin is not only irreconcilable with the effective secular religion that underlies the world-view of industrial humanity, it also threatens to undermine its most fundamental tenet, which is that science, technology and industry - perhaps allied with free trade - will create a material and technological paradise on Earth from which all the problems that have beset us over the centuries, such as poverty, disease, unemployment, homelessness, crime, drug-addiction - and, as some scientists have actually assured us, even death itself - will have been eliminated once and for all.

It follows that all benefits are seen as man-made - the product of economic development. Thus health is seen as something that is dispensed in hospitals, or at least by the medical profession, with the aid of the latest technological devices and pharmaceutical drugs. Law and order are provided by our police force in conjunction with the law courts and the prison system, and so on. And yet no value is attributed to the irreplaceable benefits derived from the normal functioning of the natural world, which assure the stability of our climate, the fertility of our

\*The author is the Editor of *The Ecologist*. This paper appeared in the first issue of this journal (1/2000).  
1. Michael Polanyi, *Personal Knowledge, Towards a Post-Critical Philosophy*, Routledge and Kegan Paul, London, 1978. *Transnational Associations* 2/2000, 74-78

soil, the replenishment of our water supplies, and the other vital components of a functioning planet. It follows that to be deprived of these non-benefits cannot constitute an economic 'cost' - and the natural systems that provide them can thereby be destroyed with almost total impunity.

This attitude is further rationalised by mainstream scientists, who set out systematically to denigrate natural processes. Darwin described nature as "clumsy, wasteful, and blundering", and Sir Peter Medawar, the Nobel Laureate, talked despairingly of "nature's own artless improvisations"<sup>2</sup>

Mainstream science also sees the natural world as individualistic, aggressive and terrifyingly cruel. For Darwin "all nature is at war", and his most eminent disciple, T. H. Huxley, concurred. "From the point of view of the moralist", he stated, in his celebrated Romanes lecture of 1890, "the animal world is about on the same level as the gladiator's show. The creatures are fairly well treated and set to fight, whereby the strongest, the swiftest, and the cunningest live to fight another day. The spectator has no need to turn his thumbs down, as no quarter is given," a statement that clearly states what has come to be known as the 'gladiatorial' view of the natural world.<sup>3</sup>

To Lester Ward, the American sociologist, the terrible shortcomings of the natural world are, as Donald Worster puts it, "but an invitation to Man to become nature's engineer and create a paradise on Earth of his own design, whose functioning he can plan and direct in all its detail."<sup>4</sup>

Darwinians and sociobiologists concur. For them, it is possible to create a good world where we behave ethically towards each other, but for this to be possible we must declare war against the evil world of nature. As Huxley put it, "the ethical progress of society depends not on imitating the cosmic process, still less in running away from it, but in combating it."<sup>5</sup> This is one of the main tenets of what is in effect a secular religious cult, which follows in direct line from that of a number of well-documented religious cults that flowered in the early history of the Western world. One of the best-documented is that of the Gnostics, the 'heretical' early-Christian movement which, like mainstream

scientists, saw the natural world as inefficient, more so, positively evil. They did not deny that there was order and law in the cosmos, but believed it was "a rigid and inimical order, a tyrannical and evil law, devoid of meaning and goodness, alien to the purposes of man and to his inner essence."<sup>6</sup>

Hence, for the Gnostics, God and the cosmos were no longer intimately related, as in the classical world. They had become alien to each other - indeed, opposites. So Man was condemned to cosmic solitude<sup>7</sup> as he is condemned too by mainstream science. Jacques Monod, the Nobel Laureate, admits, on the other hand, that animistic man could see himself as an integral part of the natural world. "Animism established a covenant between Man and nature," he says "a profound alliance, outside of which seems to stretch only terrifying solitude. But today science has revealed to us the terrible truth, the ancient covenant has been broken. Man knows at last that he is alone in the immensity of the universe, in which he has no function, in which he has no duties, and in which he emerged by pure chance."<sup>8</sup> This is an astonishing dogma, based largely on another dogma - that of the randomness of natural processes, especially the all-encompassing life process: evolution. Both are irreconcilable with any real knowledge of the structure and function of the world of living things.

*"Today, science has revealed to us the terrible truth, the ancient covenant has been broken, Man knows at last that he is alone in the immensity of the universe, in which he has no function, in which he has no duties, and in which he emerged by pure chance."*

Jacques Monod

However, there is one big difference between the position of the Gnostics and that of the mainstream scientists of today. For the former, God required that humanity break away from the evil world and restrict life to that of the spirit. The latter, though accepting the same premises, come to a very different conclusion. The world, they agree, is inefficient and badly designed - but the answer is not to hide from it but to redesign and transform it, according to their far better

2. Sir Peter Medawar, *The Hope of Progress*, Wildwood House, London, 1974, p.244.

3. T.H. Huxley & J. Huxley, *Evolution and Ethics*, The Pilot Press, London, 1947.

4. Lester Ward, quoted by Donald Worster in *Natures Economy*, Sierra Club, San Francisco, 1977.

5. *Op. cit.* 3.

6. Hans Jonas, *The Gnostic Religion*, Beacon Press, 1958, p.250.

7. *Ibid.*

8. Jacques Monod, *Chance and Necessity*, Collins, London, 1972.

design. This is the ultimate presumption and also the ultimate blasphemy. Homo Scientificus has deified himself. It is incumbent on him to recreate the world.

The critical importance of maintaining the order of the living world is only just becoming apparent to what is still a minority of scientists, largely as a result of the work of James Lovelock and Lynn Margulis. They have shown that the biosphere, or world of living things, together with its geological substrate and atmospheric environment constitute a single being. Lovelock refers to it as 'Gaia' - the Greek Goddess of the Earth. Lovelock stresses the critical importance of maintaining the order of Gaia. If the atmosphere's oxygen content were too low, then some species would not be able to breathe, while if it were too high, the Earth's atmosphere would become so inflammable that a single spark could set off uncontrollable fires. If its carbon dioxide contents were in turn too low, the Earth would be too cold, and if too high, its temperature would exceed that which most forms of life could support - a principle which scientists have ignored to the cost of humanity and the natural world. We are only now realising this; for we have systematically changed the composition of the atmosphere, and are caught up in what appears to be a chain-reaction towards ever-worsening climatic déstabilisation.

*Homo Scientificus has deified himself. It is incumbent on him to recreate the world.*

### The Importance of holism

This brings us to the thesis of this unique Millennium Issue of *The Ecologist*. Contrary to what mainstream scientists tell us, I have consistently argued that natural systems at different levels of organisation seek, consciously or not, to maintain the order of the larger wholes of which they are part. The biologist Ludwig von Bertalanffy was struck by the "whole maintaining character" of life processes at the level of the biological organism.<sup>9</sup> So was the Austrian biologist Lingerer, who was so impressed by the "whole maintaining function of life processes" that he decided to replace the biological consideration of purpose with that of wholeness.<sup>10</sup>

That the constituent parts of any natural system must strive to maintain its overall order is clear, because they evolved to fulfil their specific functions within it, and are thereby totally dependent on its preservation for their welfare and indeed for their survival. Eugene Odum, whose *Fundamentals of Ecology* was the standard textbook in American universities for decades, points out that "the individual cannot survive for long without its population, any more than the organ would be able to survive for long as a self-perpetuating unit without its organism."<sup>11</sup> Thus children brought up in a broken home, as any social worker will confirm, will often tend to be emotionally unstable and have a far greater chance of becoming social misfits, delinquents and criminals.

The family, however, cannot thrive as a little oasis of order in a sea of social disorder, and it needs to be part of a cohesive community, which is of such importance in the traditional world that people cannot imagine life outside of it. Nor, of course, can individuals, families, and communities, survive if the order of the natural world or the ecosphere is destroyed, as even the most extreme adept of the cult of selfishness will soon realise.

Unfortunately, this key principle only becomes apparent when life processes are seen in terms of their relationship with the whole of which they are part. Mainstream scientists who insist on looking at life processes in isolation from the whole - whose very existence most of them choose to ignore - continue to see them as random, malleable, godless and self-serving. This could not be better illustrated than by the writings of Professor Richard Dawkins of Oxford University, for whom there is "no selective advantage in displaying any concern for the stability and integrity of the larger whole.

If behaviour is looked at reductively, there is no way in which its 'whole-maintaining' function can be established, and hence no way of distinguishing between behaviour that serves to maintain and that which serves to disrupt the order of the living world. This key distinction is foreign to mainstream science - though critical to early archaic religions such as Judaism, as Margaret Barker in particular, makes dear elsewhere in this issue.

9. Ludwig von Bertalanffy, *Modern Theories of Development: An Introduction to Theoretical Biology*, trans. J.H. Woodger, Harper Torchbook, New York, p. 123.  
10. *Ibid.*  
11. Eugene Odum, *Fundamentals of Ecology*, W.B. Saunders, Philadelphia, 1953, p.5.  
12. Richard Dawkins, *The Selfish Gene*, Oxford University Press, Oxford, 1989.

## Why mainstream religions have failed the Earth

If it is impossible to reconcile the notion that environmental destruction is a sin with either mainstream science or Gnostic religion, so it is also difficult - though by no means so much so - to reconcile it with modern mainstream religions. For though they do not see the natural world and indeed the cosmos as evil, they have scarcely any interest in it.

Indeed, today, these religions have become increasingly 'otherworldly', and have ceased to fulfil their original role of linking people to their society, to the natural world, and to the all-encompassing cosmos. In the atomised society we have created, only interpersonal relationships make any sense, and even religion becomes little more than an interpersonal relationship between a now asocial and an-ecological man and a God to whom is attributed these same characteristics.

Mainstream religion has lost its way and needs to return to its roots, and even go further and learn from the wisdom of primal people, a point strongly made by Father Bede Griffith on page XXXX. Darryl Wilson's article 'Grandfather's Story' (page XXX) confirms this same point by providing some idea of how American Indian tribal people saw their relationship to the cosmos.

*Mainstream religion has lost its way, and needs to return to its roots.*

The relevance of tribal religions is that they are totally reconcilable with the notion that the destruction of the environment is a sin - more so, it is often their most fundamental teaching. For example, Robert Parsons, in his book on the religion of the Kono people of Sierra Leone, shows that their religion "is not only an organisation of human relationships, but it includes also the relationships of people with the Earth as a whole, with their own land, and with the unseen world of constructive forces and beings in which they believe. Religion brings them all into a consistent whole."<sup>13</sup>

To the Kono, "the Earth is more than a composition of inanimate particles of soil; it is a living being, the wife of God, with unlimited pro-

creative powers producing the abundant tropical vegetation. The main preoccupation of the Kono, like all tribal people, is to maintain cosmic harmony."<sup>14</sup>

The anthropologist Henrick Kraemer<sup>15</sup> also notes how, in primal societies, "the dominating interest is to preserve and perpetuate social harmony, stability and welfare. Religious cults and magic practices have chiefly this purpose in view. Everyone who has lived with a 'primitive people' and has tried to immerse his or her mind in theirs, knows the deep-rooted dread fostered towards any disturbance of the universal and social harmony and equilibrium. Whether a violation of this harmony issues from the universal sphere - for example, by an unusual occurrence in nature - or from the social, by a transgression of tradition or a disturbing event, it calls forth a corporate and strenuous religious activity towards restoring the harmony and thereby saving the fertility of their fields, their health, the security of their families, the stability and welfare of their tribe from becoming endangered.

In fact, just about all the activities of tribal people are geared to the achievement of this same end, whether it be their agricultural activities, the technologies they use, the design of their houses, of their temples, of their settlements or the performance of sacred rituals. Beyond their utilitarian functions, they all serve to maintain, in their eyes, the order of the cosmos. Indeed, to violate this principle, in particular to neglect the performance of these sacred rituals, is to violate all sorts of taboo - and in the words of Roger Caillouis, "an act is taboo because it disrupts the universal order, which is at once that of nature and society." By so doing, "the Earth might no longer yield a harvest, the cattle might be struck with infertility, the stars might no longer follow their appointed course, death and disease could stalk the land."<sup>16</sup> To violate a taboo is to be guilty of cosmic sin.

And, in fact, this can be seen to be true. The recent storms and floods in Orissa and Vietnam, and the increased incidence of devastating droughts throughout the world, are the result of cutting down forests and of transforming the chemical composition of the atmosphere so that it resembles ever less that which is required to maintain the order of the ecosphere. Whether

13. Robert Parsons, *Religion in an African Society*, ed. E.J. Brill, Leiden, 1964, p. 176.

14. *Ibid.*

15. Henrick Kraemer, *The Christian Message in a Non-Christian World*, Harper, New York, 1938.

16. Roger Caillouis, *L'Homme et le Sacré*, Gallimard, Paris, 1950, p.24.

we like it or not, the religio-culture of tribal peoples tells them the truth about their relationship with the cosmos. It does so, of course, in their special way - the way that would be best understood and believed in - not just intellectually, but with their heart and soul. It tells them the truth in the way that is most likely to be acted upon.

### Religion and ecology

The great anthropologist Roy Rappaport points out that the important question concerning the beliefs, or 'cognitive models', of primal people, "is not the extent to which they are identical with what the analyst states to be reality, but the extent to which they direct behaviour in ways that are appropriate to the biological well-being of the actors and the ecosystems in which they participate."<sup>17</sup> He might have added "and the welfare of the ecosphere as a whole." "The criterion of adequacy for a model is not its accuracy but its adaptive effectiveness"<sup>18</sup> - in the real holistic sense of the term. If primal beliefs or 'cognitive models' satisfy this criterion, then they are clearly 'true' in the most important sense of the word.

This is so, regardless of the fact that they may be formulated in the language of gods and spirits whose physical existence could be denied by

our scientists. But to do so would miss the point. Whether they be historical figures or not is unimportant. They are, above all, archetypes. The same can be said of the truths of traditional mainstream religions. It is irrelevant to ask whether Noah's flood as described in the Old Testament actually occurred. It may well have done, but that is not the point. The flood symbolises the forces of chaos that were let loose when people failed to observe the cosmic covenant. Noah's flood was an archetype, not necessarily an historical event, and its role as an archetype is incomparably more important in the determination of adaptive human behaviour than any possible role it may fulfil as a scientific or historical truth.

*It is irrelevant to ask whether Noah's flood as described in the Old Testament actually occurred. It may well have done, but that is not the point.*

This brings us to the real purpose of this Millennium Issue. It is, above all, to show that these ideas figured prominently in the theology of our early mainstream religions, but that we have lost sight of them. If this is so, then they must be resuscitated, for it is only in this way that religion can inspire people to unite against the forces of chaos that are threatening our very survival.

*8th November 1999*

17. Roy A. Rappaport, *Ritual and Religion in the Making of Humanity*, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 1999, p.364.  
18. *Ibid.*



# La charte des droits fondamentaux de l'Union européenne

## Contribution de cafecs

par Anne David\*

Depuis septembre 1996 et, à cette époque, à la suite de la publication du rapport « Pour une Europe des droits civiques et sociaux » - élaboré, à la demande de la Commission européenne, par un Comité des Sages présidé par Mme Pintasilgo, ancien premier ministre du Portugal, et dont Frédéric Pascal, président de la Fonda, a été membre et Jean-Baptiste de Foucauld, ancien Commissaire au plan, rapporteur - la Fonda anime<sup>1</sup> un débat en vue de sensibiliser les associations à la construction d'une Europe plus civique et plus sociale. La Fonda entend contribuer à alimenter le débat pour forger une opinion publique et une conscience collective favorables à une Europe fondée sur les valeurs de justice, de responsabilité et de solidarité, à l'intérieur comme à l'extérieur de ses frontières.

La Fonda réunit des acteurs associatifs issus de secteurs diversifiés qui, au-delà de leur champ d'activité sectoriel, veulent contribuer à faire avancer l'idée d'une Europe qui puisse réussir son intégration politique, son développement social, son union monétaire et son élargissement. Ils se réunissent au sein d'un groupe qui a pris le nom de CAFECES (Carrefour pour une Europe civique et sociale). CAFECES est un groupe ouvert, pluraliste, sans adhésion formelle, mais dont les membres et les associations dont ils sont issus adhèrent à la construction d'une Europe civique et sociale et se réfèrent à la Déclaration du 25 mars 1997 « Pour une Europe civique et sociale ».

Le Conseil européen de Cologne des 3 et 4 juin 1999 a prévu qu'à l'occasion de la prochaine révision des traités soient réunis les droits fondamentaux en vigueur au niveau de l'Union, dans une charte, de manière à leur donner une plus grande visibilité.

La procédure prévue par le Conseil européen pour l'élaboration de cette Charte n'est pas à la hauteur de l'enjeu qu'un tel texte représente. La future Charte ne peut pas être seulement le résultat d'une simple compilation des textes existants, alors que les évolutions de la société devraient inciter à un effort en vue d'améliorer les formulations, d'approfondir et, dans certains cas, de compléter les droits existants. La participation des citoyens est prévue par le biais des représentants des Parlements nationaux et du Parlement européen au sein de la Convention, qui a été désignée<sup>2</sup>

et qui peut entendre « d'autres instances, groupes sociaux ou experts »<sup>3</sup>. Le processus de consultation envisagé, bien que substantiellement amélioré, n'est ni assez large, ni assez ouvert.

L'action menée par CAFECES cherche à pallier pour partie ces défauts. Elle permet une participation citoyenne à l'élaboration de la Charte et veut proposer, à la Convention, des éléments d'approfondissement pour améliorer et enrichir la réflexion, sur des thèmes qui touchent les intérêts des associations qui participent à CAFECES. La liste des thèmes ne prétend donc pas à l'exhaustivité.

### 1. Identité européenne et droits de l'homme

L'Europe se caractérise par l'extrême diversité des peuples qui la composent, mais aussi par la communauté des valeurs autour desquelles ceux-ci se retrouvent. Ils attachent la même valeur suprême à la dignité de la personne humaine, et ils ont des conceptions et des exigences communes en matière de démocratie et de droits de l'homme. Ce sont ces valeurs partagées qui fondent l'identité européenne. L'Europe ne peut se construire qu'en les mettant au premier rang de ce qu'elle entreprend, que ce soit dans l'évolution de ses institutions, dans ses politiques internes, dans sa politique d'élargissement ou dans ses relations avec le reste du monde.

### 2. Droit d'accès au sens et au patrimoine symbolique de l'humanité

La privatisation d'une partie des ressources de sens est d'abord cause d'un appauvrissement du patrimoine culturel dont dispose la société démocratique pour se penser elle-même. Cette privatisation est ensuite source d'inégalité profonde, tout particulièrement à l'égard des milieux socialement défavorisés. Sous couvert de neutralité, elle n'offre pas la chance à tous les hommes d'avoir accès à la diversité des systèmes d'interprétations de la vie humaine, et de construire leur identité personnelle. En refoulant de la culture commune la dimension morale et spirituelle de l'existence humaine, elle nourrit les phénomènes fondamentalistes, communautaristes et sectaires.

\*Déléguée générale de la Fonda.

Tél. : 01 45 49 06 58

Fax: 01 42 84 04 84

fonda@wanadoo.fr

CAFECES, c/o Fonda,

18, rue de Varenne,

75007 Paris

1. La Fonda est une association

pour la promotion de

la vie associative

2. Convention comprend

15 représentants des chefs

d'Etat ou de gouvernement

des Etats membres, un

représentant de la

Commission européenne,

16 membres du Parlement

européen désignés par lui,

30 membres des parlements

nationaux désignés par

ceux-ci.

3. Une audition des organi-

sations de la société civile

devant la Convention est

prévue le 27 avril.

Associations transnationales

2/2000, 79-81

Pour garder vivantes les sources historiques, philosophiques, littéraires, spirituelles, religieuses de l'humanité, un droit nouveau doit être élaboré au niveau européen afin d'organiser leur transmission et leurs échanges. Ceci doit se réaliser aussi bien dans le système d'enseignement que dans la formation permanente, dans les médias ou dans la production culturelle.

### *3. Développement durable et droits de l'homme*

La croissance économique ne suffit pas à elle seule à assurer le développement. Le développement « durable » est un concept plus complexe, car il veille au respect des contraintes environnementales et culturelles tout en recherchant la viabilité économique et la finalité sociale. L'exploitation des ressources du globe qui constituent le bien commun de l'humanité doit être menée avec un double souci de solidarité : solidarité synchronique avec la génération présente et solidarité diachronique avec les générations futures. L'Europe ne peut pas proclamer son attachement aux droits de l'homme sans contribuer fortement à la mise en place au niveau mondial d'un développement durable ainsi entendu.

### *4. Du droit au travail au droit à l'activité*

Le droit au travail est déjà inscrit dans de nombreuses législations européennes, mais il n'est que programmatique. Ceci n'empêche pas un taux de chômage très élevé. On estime qu'avec une croissance continue, il y aura toujours au moins un taux de 6 à 7 % de chômage structurel. Ceci est inacceptable pour l'égalité de dignité de la personne humaine. Toute personne, à défaut d'un emploi, doit avoir possibilité d'exercer une activité d'intérêt public en échange d'un revenu égal au salaire minimum du pays. Ce droit doit être invoqué devant les tribunaux.

### *5. Droit à des moyens d'existence digné*

Le niveau des richesses produites aujourd'hui est en grande partie le résultat d'une accumulation de connaissances, de capital matériel et social, qui elle-même est le fruit des efforts des générations précédentes. Chaque individu peut

en revendiquer l'héritage du simple fait qu'il est homme, quel que soit son âge, qu'il soit actif ou non. D'autre part, la réponse apportée aujourd'hui aux phénomènes d'exclusion prend la forme d'une multiplicité d'aides dont la gestion est d'une grande lourdeur bureaucratique, comporte toujours des lacunes, et se révèle souvent contraire à la dignité et à l'autonomie des bénéficiaires. Reconnaître à chaque personne le droit à un revenu inconditionnel apparaît dès lors une hypothèse qui mérite examen.

### *6. Droit au temps choisi*

Tout individu a des responsabilités envers lui-même, sa famille et les différents groupes sociaux dont il fait partie, et ces responsabilités demandent qu'il leur consacre une partie de son temps. Or de nombreux facteurs d'évolution des conditions de travail rendent la durée effective de celui-ci de plus en plus difficile à encadrer et à contrôler. En outre, la fonction économique tend à déborder toutes les autres en s'arrogeant sur elles une priorité quasi absolue. Il apparaît donc nécessaire de faire émerger un droit nouveau, conduisant à imposer aux conditions de travail des contraintes temporelles qui permettent aux individus l'exercice effectif de l'ensemble de leurs responsabilités.

### *7. Droit d'asile*

Le droit d'asile est un droit dont le principe est reconnu sans discussion. Les bouleversements de l'environnement politique, social et économique dans lequel se présentent les demandeurs d'asile rendent néanmoins son application de plus en plus délicate et en font un droit qui est aujourd'hui menacé. Il apparaît donc souhaitable que l'Europe rappelle avec force le principe du droit d'asile, précise les conditions d'admission des demandeurs sur le territoire communautaire et mette de l'ordre dans les textes qui régissent le droit d'asile aujourd'hui au niveau européen.

### *8. Droits du citoyen et technologies de l'information et de la communication*

L'extraordinaire développement des techniques de traitement et de diffusion de l'infor-

marión représente pour la démocratie à la fois des menaces et des chances.

Saisir les chances suppose de donner à tous un droit et des possibilités effectives d'accès aux réseaux, assorti d'un droit à la formation nécessaire pour dominer avec une autonomie critique suffisante un flux considérable d'informations. Cela implique également que le développement de la production offerte sur le réseau relève de critères qui ne soient pas purement marchands.

Les menaces concernent en premier lieu les possibilités d'atteinte à la liberté, à la dignité ou à l'intimité des personnes. Les risques d'utilisation délictuelle ou criminelle doivent aussi être considérés. Tout cela nécessite le développement d'un droit nouveau.

#### *9. Bioéthique et droits de l'homme*

Les progrès de la biologie et de la médecine posent des questions d'ordre éthique qui ont déjà fait l'objet de réflexions approfondies. Elles sont assez mûres aujourd'hui pour que l'Europe puisse envisager de formuler solennellement les principes dont elle entend s'inspirer. Il conviendrait d'abord de rappeler que le champ de la bioéthique n'échappe pas au principe de la souveraineté populaire. C'est à la loi démocratiquement élaborée et proclamée de poser les règles.

Les principes de base à prendre en compte sont la dignité de la personne et le respect d'une proportionnalité raisonnable entre moyens et fins.

#### *10. Droit d'accès aux droits fondamentaux*

Les mécanismes sociaux de marginalisation et d'exclusion ont pour effet que ceux qui en sont victimes ne parviennent pas ou plus à faire valoir pratiquement les droits fondamentaux qui leur sont reconnus. Ils n'ont ni la capacité de s'orienter dans les services administratifs, ni la maîtrise des procédures à mettre en œuvre, ni le temps d'attendre leur éventuel aboutissement. Il apparaît ainsi nécessaire de proclamer un droit à l'accès aux droits fondamentaux et de faire en sorte qu'il soit concrètement exercé.

Quelle que soit l'issue donnée aux travaux de la Convention qui, globalement aura rempli sa mission, la soixantaine d'articles qu'elle proposera consolideront les droits éparés dans diverses conventions internationales sous une forme lisible par le citoyen.

Le processus mérite d'être poursuivi pour permettre un approfondissement sur de nombreuses questions. C'est pourquoi CAFECs demande que la Convention soit prorogée pour une période de trois ans.

*Avril 2000*

Review Article

## Feminism, Internationalism and Capitalism; The Plural and the Singular

by Peter Waterman \*

Mrinalini Sinha, Donna Guy and Angela Woollacott (eds.), *Feminisms and Internationalism*, Blackwell, Oxford and Maiden (MA). 1999. 264 pp.

Let us start with the claim of the book, as printed on the back cover, and illustrated by a photo of middle-class European and Asian women, some in Asian costume, many wearing cloche hats, under palm trees, at some conference in the late-1920s: «*Feminisms and Internationalism* addresses the theme of the history of internationalism in feminist theory and praxis. It engages some of the following topics: the ways in which 'internationalism' has been conceived historically within feminism and women's movements; the nature of and the historical shifts within 'imperial' feminisms; changes in the meaning of feminist internationalism both preceding and following the end of most formal empires in the twentieth-century; the challenges to, and the reformulations of, internationalism within feminism by women of colour and by women from colonised or formerly colonised countries; the fragmentation of internationalism in response to a growing emphasis on local over global context of struggle as well as on a variety of different feminisms instead of a singular feminism; and the context for the re-emergence of internationalism within feminisms and women's movements as a result of the new modes of globalisation in the late twentieth-century.»

This is an ambitious agenda. But so is the very title of the book, the first such of which I am aware. We begin with quite extensive abstracts, revealing authors with roots in Korea, Latin America, China, India, Iran and West Africa(?), as well as the more usual North-American and West-European ones. In addition to the introduction and a set of seven cases (the body of the book), we are offered a forum, followed by several review essays. The authors of the seven articles are all new names to me - as are those of the editors - which is again promising. The forum is led off by a veteran historian of Latin American feminisms, Asunci, we are offered a forum, followed by several review essays. The authors of the seven articles are all new names to me - as are thon and Val Moghadam.

The editorial introduction provides further

orientation to the collection. This is where the back cover blurb comes from. I think, however we immediately run into a problem here, because the editors neither define nor discuss 'internationalism'. As a matter of fact, they don't define or discuss 'feminisms' much either. But a useful contemporary understanding of such can nowadays be assumed (and in any case is much discussed elsewhere in the book). This is not the case for 'internationalism' which, curiously for our pluralist times, appears here in the singular.

The editors apparently looked for historical (or historians') contributions, and seem to consider that such provide the necessary basis for further academic work on the subject. Yet it seems to me that while we have an increasing body of historical work in this field (see the review articles and bibliography, as well as that in Waterman 1998: Chapter 6), what we lack is precisely theory. In the absence of a conceptualisation, a model, or some organising hypothesis, we are likely to create something in which the whole is less than the sum of the parts. The editors *do* argue for a certain orientation, but this is a general and now commonplace one, seeking a mean between or beyond an abstract universalism and a particularistic relativism. They also make much of 'defamiliarising' and 'decentering'. But this implies that there *exist* theories, theorists, schools, traditions or tendencies which require such. And, unfortunately, the one classical liberal-feminist historical work worthy of this (Bernard 1987) is nowhere even referred to!

As a result of the above, the articles and reviews sections seem to be held together more by reference to the *international* than to internationalism. There is, therefore, in this collection much about feminism and (anti-)imperialism, or international relations, and even development. The piece on Yemen makes no reference even to the international and actually belongs to the abundant literature on feminism and nationalism! And even if the collection is admirably sensitive to westocentrism it is not to

\*Institute of Social Studies,  
The Hague  
email:  
p. waterman@hotmail.com  
global solidarity site:  
http://www.antenna.nl  
-waterman/

classocentrism. Although labour, socialism and international feminism *are* mentioned in the introduction, they seem to be hidden from the following history. We are dealing here almost exclusively with middle-class feminists and middle-class women (sometimes aristocratic ones). I find this both detrimental to the project and somewhat puzzling.

My feeling is that the history of left and popular feminism internationalisms is likely to provide more lessons for the future than that of the liberal and middle-class ones. The latter are today abundant: the problem is precisely making them popular, radically-democratic, egalitarian, and socially-transformatory (a nice way of redefining 'socialism?'). The only explanation I can come up with for this academic blindspot is the international shift from a social-movement to a political-institutional feminism, in which primary attention goes to those who - in the past as in the present - are most politically articulate and influential, who both read and write feminism...or, possibly, the domination of feminism (as much else in academia) by discourse analysis, which focuses on meanings at the expense of doings...?

This does not, of course, mean that the case studies are necessarily lacking in either historical interest or contemporary political relevance.

Christine Ehrick's chapter on interwar (the European World ones) liberal feminism in Uruguay has a fine feeling for North-South, South-South and Argentina-Uruguay contradictions and dynamics, as well as for the class composition and orientation of her particular movement. My feeling is that such national/regional conflicts were *inevitable* in the period of national-industrial-imperial capitalism. Which does not - as we will immediately see - mean they will disappear of their own accord during our global-informational capitalist period.

Ping-Chun Hsiung and Yuk-Lin Renita Wong employ an understanding of 'difference feminism' (my phrase) to identify independent feminist/women's movement voices in China, which are seeking their own understandings independent of both Western feminism and the Chinese party/state. Each of the latter two claims to speak for Chinese women and they are (therefore?) in diametrical opposition to each other.

There is, however, a curiosity here since the authors associate their Western feminism (which they specify quite distinctly), with 'the confrontational paradigm projected in the NGO model' (ix). In so far as the Western NGO model, both nationally and internationally, has been increasingly criticised precisely for its excessive engagement with the state/interstate (Alvarez 1998), there seems to me a possibility that this and the Chinese feminist strategy might meet - but at an increasingly problematic place for the development of a global feminist movement!

Now: most of the earlier-mentioned shortcomings are more than compensated for in the exchange between Asunción Lavrin (on Latin America), Leila Rupp ('the Centre'), Mary E. John (India), Shahnaz Rouse (on Islam) and Jayne O. Ifekwunigwe (on 'borderland feminisms'). The 30 or so pages of discussion do not relate closely to the contents of the book. What they do is to begin a cross-national/regional/cultural/epistemological dialogue on women and internationalism that has not previously existed.

Lavrin, who launches the discussion, notes the particularity of Latin American (LA) feminism in successive periods, but she rather emphasises its specific contribution to the international (beyond LA) than its participation in such. She also identifies a sharp debate within LA, between what one might consider an *indigenista* feminist (one who tends to fetishise the indigenous, as distinguished from those that variously express it) and those more open to the international. She also shows a welcome class sensitivity where she states that: "It has been argued that theory is necessary to feminisms for opening channels of understanding across national boundaries because theory has the universal quality that makes feminism international...Yet, the dilemma of how to make theories accessible to women without formal education becomes more puzzling the more sophisticated the theories become...Perhaps the most important task of international feminism is to find that ample theoretical framework capable of embracing the largest number of female *experiences*." (186. Original emphasis)

This is, again, an important reflection on international feminism but not on feminist interna-

tionism. And although she echoes the common Northern feminist admiration of the achievements of the LA and Caribbean feminist *encuentros*, she seems to have missed the last (hopefully only the latest) one in Chile, 1996, at which long-invisible or hidden tensions exploded in not only a disruptive but also a destructive manner.

Leila Rupp has recently published a book on three or four major international 19<sup>th</sup>-20<sup>th</sup> century organisations of what she herself calls "elite, older, Christian women of European origin" (190). Although she might seem to be there reproducing the limitations of the collection under consideration, her ideas on how to approach/understand feminist internationalism are actually much broader. She argues for looking at this less in ideological terms than in those of the senses and levels of collective self-identity: e.g. organisational, movement and gender ones. In such terms, she suggests, what is important about the conflict Lavrin mentions is less the ideological difference than the fact that they are talking to each other about it. If her first remarks suggest an interesting research methodology or project, the second might be taken as suggesting the increasing Generality of communicational form to a contemporary internationalism. Rupp concludes on the necessity for looking at feminisms and internationalism (singular again!) from national, comparative and international locations. Then, in a wisely iffy sentence, she argues optimistically for the promise of global feminisms. If nationalism and internationalism do not have to act as polar opposites; if we can conceptualise feminisms broadly enough to encompass a vast array of local variations displaying multiple identities; if we work to dismantle the barriers to participation in national and international women's movements; if we build on the basic common denominators of women's relationship to production and reproduction, however multifaceted in practice; then we can envisage truly global feminisms that can, in truth, change the world (194).

Mary E. John, from India begins by recognising South Asian feminist ignorance of Latin America (an ignorance which, I can assure her, is blankly, cheerfully or shamefacedly reciprocated). She therefore begins by informing Lavrin, or Latin America - or in any case us - of the history

of Indian feminisms. She continues with a challenging reflection on the manner in which globalisation has undermined simple and traditional meanings and oppositions between the 'local' and the 'global', given the extent to which globalisation, even in its early colonial manifestation, helped create the contemporary 'local' manifestations of Hinduism and caste. She then addresses the problematic concepts of 'pluralism' and 'diversity', emphasising (Thank Goddess!) what I earlier suggested, that If feminism is not singular, neither is internationalism' (199). She continues with examples of existing or possible internationalisms rooted in the subcontinent. And ends, again optimistically, on the possibility and necessity of more egalitarian and dialogic

Western collaborations, new perspectives on the South Asian region and the Indian diaspora, and attempts to rethink South-South relations. (202)

Shahnaz Rouse's interrogation of religious difference from what one might call the point-of-view-of-internationalism has a particularly sharp cutting edge. She continues the line traced by Leila Rupp, criticising the academic shift: 1) from a materialist to 'a right of centre, culturalist, even a "civilisational" focus', b) to a kind of "orientalism in reverse", and c) an ontology of difference, and a new "exclusiveness" (206). This is fighting talk, informed by a spirit of cosmopolitanism, egalitarianism and solidarity (i.e. internationalism). But if she may here be criticising her academic or ethnic sisters, she cuts equally radically into a classist feminism.

Echoing, again, earlier forum contributions, she argues for a retreat (an advance surely?) from the politics of difference, whether religious or secular, to a politics of experience: "What is called for is a return to the 'everyday as problematic'...The starting point here is not discourse but experience, fraught as that notion may be, and implicated as it is, in representation itself (in the dual sense, figurative and literal)...Rather than positing cultural authenticity in reified, de-historicised ways, we need to examine how capitalism creates difference in seemingly totalising ways but which if examined more closely reveal the close link between existing differences and power relations: secular and religious discourses themselves being two of these." (208)

*Capitalism*. Now that is a word, and world.

which I would have thought highly relevant to a discussion about the past, present and future of feminism and internationalism! I may be revealing my own particular particularism if I admit that I have, here, no major objection to it being referred to in the singular. I would only suggest two directions in which it might be usefully specified if studies of women and internationalism are to be furthered. The first, already implied, is in terms of its historical phases, particularly the threats, promises and seductions of its contemporary globalised form. The second, hardly mentioned, never theorised and barely

#### References

Alvarez, Sonia. 1998. 'Latin American Feminisms "Go Global": Trends of the 1990s and Challenges for the New Millennium', in Alvarez, Sonia, Evelina Dagnino, and Arturo Escobar (eds.), *Cultures of Politics/Politics of Cultures: Revisioning Latin-American Social Movements*. Boulder: Westview. Pp. 293-324.

Strategised is that of *money* - simultaneously the most abstract and concrete manifestation of capitalism. This is something which, apparently, the women internationalists - handing it out or receiving it - still consider it difficult to talk about, whether in mixed company or in public. While their grandmothers, in the cloche hats, might have considered this simply bad taste, the granddaughters presumably see it as a discourse of vulgar materialism. Introducing the everyday into the analysis, theorisation and strategising of feminist internationalism may be more difficult than our last author imagines.

Bernard, Jessie. 1987. *The Female World from a Global Perspective*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press. 287 pp.

Waterman, Peter. 1998. 'Beyond Internationalism: Women, Feminism and the New Global Solidarity', in *Globalisation, Social Movements and the New Internationalisms*. London: Mansell. Pp. 153-97.

## Un nouveau président pour la Commission de liaison des ONG

*Strasbourg, 02.02.2000* : Les 400 ONG internationales dotées du statut consultatif auprès du Conseil de l'Europe ont tenu leur conférence plénière annuelle le 26 janvier 2000 à Strasbourg et ont élu Daniel Zielinski Président de la Commission de Liaison pour les deux années à venir.

M. Zielinski est Vice-Président de la Fédération internationale des Maisons de l'Europe, et Directeur de l'Académie européenne du Nord de l'Europe, basée à Lille, France. Il est également respon-

sable du regroupement des ONG auprès du Conseil de l'Europe "La société civile dans la nouvelle Europe".

Le nouveau Président s'est donné pour priorités de répondre à trois défis majeurs:

- réussir la réunification de la Grande Europe,
- favoriser, face à la mondialisation, une société civile européenne qui défende les valeurs fondamentales (démocratie, droits de l'homme, défense des marginalisés),

- assurer un développement équilibré du continent européen dans le domaine social, de la protection des droits fondamentaux, et de l'environnement. Les trois vice-Présidents nouvellement élus sont :

Marc Leyenberger (France, Caritas Internationalis),

Dirk Jarré (Allemagne, Conseil international de l'Action sociale), et Annelise Oeschger (Suisse, Mouvement international ATD - Quart Monde).

(Communiqué)

## USTR, commerce to solicit views from NGOs

U.S. Trade Representative Charlene Barshefsky and Commerce Secretary William Daley have launched an initiative that will permit interested non-governmental organizations greater participation in the development of U.S. trade policy, the Office of the U.S. Trade Representative (USTR) says.

The joint initiative announced January 11 responds to requests by environmental and other non-governmental organizations

(NGCs) for greater participation in policy making. The initiative stems from a U.S. District Court decision in November 1999 that directed USTR and Commerce "to include qualified environmental representatives on two Industry Sector Advisory Committees established under federal law," the announcement said.

Previously the Clinton administration and Congress had established a number of official advisory

committees, which have provided advice from environmental, labor and other non-governmental organizations. "The advisory committee system is but one of a variety of mechanisms through which the Administration seeks advice from interested groups and organizations on the development of U.S. trade policy," the announcement said.

## Le plus grand syndicat du monde

Le syndicat allemand des services publics et des transports (OeTV) et 4 autres syndicats, celui des médias (IG Medien), des postiers (DPG), du commerce, des banques et des assurances (HBV) et celui des employés (DAG) ont décidé de fusionner pour donner naissance en 2001 au plus grand syndicat du monde. Avec environ 3 millions d'adhérents, "verdi" ou *Vereinens*

*Dienstleistungsgewerkschaft* de son nom complet, devrait détrôner le célèbre syndicat allemand des métallos, IG Metall de Sa place de premier syndicat mondial. IG Metall compte plus de 2,5 millions d'adhérents. Les deux centrales sont affiliées à la fédération des syndicats allemands (DGB) adhérente de la CISL. Grâce à leur fusion, les cinq syndicats espèrent

reconquérir les adhérents qui les ont quittés ces dernières années, notamment à cause de la montée du chômage. Les syndicats veulent également accroître leur pouvoir de négociation, face à des organisations patronales toujours plus puissantes, en raison de la crise économique.

(Le Monde,

10  
déc. 99-janv. 2000)



## Transparency International

Dr Frits Hondius, a member of UAI's Council, has been appointed representative to the Council of Europe of Transparency International (TI), the anti-corruption coalition based in Berlin, as per 3 April 2000.

He will cease to represent the Association mondiale des amis de l'enfance (AMADE). He remains Chief Trustee of the Europhil Trust, the European affiliate of Interphil. Transparency International is

expected to apply in the near future for consultative status with the Council of Europe. Until that time, Dr Hondius will attend the NGO meetings in his capacity as alternate member of the delegation of Interphil.

## Etat de droit vs. Etat des droits

Le Réseau européen droit et société annonce l'organisation de deux séminaires :

### 1. *Etat de Droit vs. Etat des Droits*

Le rôle de la société civile dans les transformations de l'Etat et du Droit à l'aube du XXIème siècle.

Programme détaillé :

<http://sos-net.eu.org/red&s/activate/barcelone/index.htm>  
ou <http://sos-net.eu.org/red&s/activate/barcelone/program.pdf>

Inscription en ligne :

<http://sos-net.eu.org/red&s/activate/barcelone/inscrip.htm>

Séminaire du Réseau européen droit et société. Maison des Sciences de l'Homme de Paris. Centre de Théorie du Droit. Paris X. Nanterre.

Association Droit et Société  
Service pour la Science et la Technologie

(Ambassade de France)

CIRIT

Contact : Maison des Sciences de l'Homme de Paris

[www.msh-paris.fr/red&s/](http://www.msh-paris.fr/red&s/)

Lieu et date :

Institut de Ciències Polítiques i Socials

Grup d'Estudis Sociojurídics  
UAB (ICPS)

C/ Mallorca 244, pral. 08008.  
Barcelona.

1-2, Juin 2000

[gres@cpdp.uab.es](mailto:gres@cpdp.uab.es)

ph: 34-93-5812235

fax: 34-93-5812988

Institut de Ciències Polítiques i Socials, Departament de Ciència Política i Dret Public, UAB.

Stagiaires: 45 maximum.

Langues du colloque: catalan, espagnol, français et anglais (traduction prévue).

Objectifs:

(a) A la suite des réunions précédentes (Séminaires RED&S et Ecoles Thématiques en Sociologie du Droit CNRS), nous nous sommes aperçus de l'importance qu'il y a à proposer une Ecole Européenne Droit et Société [2001], pour réunir et étudier les résultats des analyses sur la transformation du droit et de l'Etat contemporains menées par les équipes de recherche du RED&S.

(b) Cette possibilité a été discutée dans une réunion à l'ICPS de Barcelone (novembre 1998) par A.J.Arnaud, J.Commaïlle, P.Guibentif et P.Casanovas. Nous avons décidé aussi de tenir un Séminaire de Haut Niveau à Barcelone le 1-2 Juin 2000 pour mettre au point un des phénomènes plus intéressants pour le droit de cette fin-de-siècle: l'émergence des formes socio-juridiques des sociétés civiles, en

même temps que les marchés globalisés et la crise des formes normatives de l'Etat de Droit classique. (c) L'objectif scientifique du Séminaire de Barcelone est de discuter de la dialectique de la défense des droits collectifs et des droits individuels dans la nouvelle structure des Etats. On pourra, par exemple, décrire le rapport que l'arbitrage, la médiation et les formes de conciliation formelles et informelles (la 'petite justice') entretiennent avec les formes juridiques étatiques (les systèmes administratifs de justice) dans le développement des grandes villes métropolitaines. Il n'est pas exclu, non plus, d'envisager le sujet du point de vue de l'organisation économique et politique des marchés et des entreprises (avec les nouvelles fonctions des puissantes Chambres de Commerce). Mais le Séminaire entend aller plus loin. Au-delà de ces formes relativement typiques il y a d'autres points de repère: l'apparition, dans l'organisation même de la société civile, de nouvelles formes socio-juridiques qui font fi des administrations locales, des marchés et des institutions, tout en se trouvant au croisement des uns et des autres dans un cadre à la fois local et international (européen). Bref, le 'translocal' produit

du droit. Organisation: (i) Il y aura trois séances plénières (conférences) sur le thème de la société civile et du droit: (a) Obstacles à l'émergence d'une société civile européenne; (b) état de Droit et dynamique local/global, et (c) Technologie, réseaux d'information et production juridique, (ii) Il y aura en outre, trois ateliers en parallèle pour permettre aux participants de présenter des communications: (a) aspects méthodologiques de l'étude empirique des organisations et des réseaux professionnels de la justice (formelle et informelle); (b) marché, droit des finances, entreprises et réseaux de décision; (c) transformation structurelle de l'Etat (normes, techniques dérogatoires.

droits...), (les personnes intéressées à donner une contribution dans les ateliers mentionnés ci-dessus sont priées d'en adresser le titre et un résumé de deux pages au plus, portant mention du nom, de la fonction et de l'attache institutionnelle de l'auteur, avant le 3 avril, délai de rigueur, à l'adresse suivante: Dr. Antoni Roig <antoni.roig@uab.es> Facultat de Dret Universitat Autònoma de Barcelona 08193 Bellaterra (Barcelona) Spain

## 2. *ELSEN et CAMPAGNOLO à Genève*

Deux visions philosophiques de la souveraineté Table ronde autour de l'ouvrage "Hans Kelsen-Umberto Campagnolo, Diritto

internazionale e Stato sovrano" édité par Mario G. Losano présidée par Peter Haggemacher avec la participation de Mme Michelle Campagnolo-Bouvier et MM. Luigi Condorelli, Charles Leben, Mario G.Losano, Victor Monnier, Carlo Santulli.  
Mardi 4 avril 2000 18h15  
Institut universitaire de hautes études internationales,  
Auditorium Jacques Freymond,  
132 rue de Lausanne, Genève.

La table ronde est organisée par l'Institut universitaire de hautes études internationales, Genève; par l'Université de Genève Faculté de droit, département de droit international public et par Thémis Centre d'Etudes de Philosophie et de Sociologie du Droit, Genève.

## 'See Change' campaign gathers support, irks Vatican

Senior Vatican spokesmen have been forced to respond to the 'See Change' campaign that aims to change the status of the Vatican at the United Nations (UN). The conservative Italian news agency Zenit quoted two official Vatican spokesmen forcefully outlining their objections to the campaign. "What privileges are they referring to?" Archbishop Renato Martino, Vatican Permanent Observer at the United Nations, asked the Italian daily Avenite. "In fact, the Holy See has had both an active and passive right of legation since the 4th century. Its international juridical status is universally recognized. How can a seat at the UN be considered a privilege, when the Holy See has had stable diplomatic relations for centuries with a great number of countries?" The official Holy See's spokesman, Joaquin Navarro-Valls

apparently "dismissed" the 'See Change' Campaign as "a clumsy attempt to silence the Catholic Church".

The Vatican's response follows news that the campaign has been gathering incredible support from throughout the world and condemnation of the Vatican from UK Secretary of State for International Development Claire Short who denounced the Holy See's delegation at the United Nations. The Vatican was steering a "morally destructive course" that would lead to increased incidence of illegal abortion, unwanted pregnancy and HIV/AIDS, according to Short. For a senior UK politician to speak out against another UN delegation and state that it was playing a "deeply obstructive role" and was in an "unholy alliance with reactionary forces" is a significant move away

from the diplomatic tones normally associated with the UN. BUE given the Vatican's stance on reproductive rights and choices, it was a vital statement in support of those who become ill or even die as a result of the Catholic church's policies.

Non-governmental organizations also challenged the Vatican. Both the Youth Delegation and a wide coalition of women's organizations issued open letters questioning Vatican positions in light of the church's teachings, especially its strong commitment to the poor and marginalized, many of whom are women.

The Holy See's attempts to obstruct general agreement on matters relating to reproductive health and choices at the UN are well known and generally supported by only a few countries, principally Sudan, Libya, Morocco, Argentina

and Guatemala. Notably, however, a number of countries with large Catholic populations - including Mexico, Brazil, Bolivia, Paraguay, Venezuela and Peru - spoke out in favour of policies that directly contradicted church positions and Holy See interventions.

Thousands of people and hundreds of NGOs from all corners of the globe have taken action against the Vatican. A postcard campaign, initiated by Catholics for a Free Choice, has called for a review of the Vatican's 'state' status. The 'See Change' campaign is long overdue, and is a response to years of Vatican obstructionism at the United Nations. Supporters of the campaign believe that the

Roman Catholic church should participate in the United Nations in the same way as the world's other religions do - as non-governmental organizations - and have called on the UN Secretary-General to review the church's current status.

The Vatican should be able to add its voice to public policy debates, but not on the same basis as governments that can be held accountable by those who will be directly affected by its health care policies. International health issues like these are too important to allow the leaders of one religion to sit as equals with governments at the policy table.

David Nolan

'See Change' campaign post-cards can be signed online at a special website

<[www.seechanges.org](http://www.seechanges.org)> to show support for this important initiative. Postcards for supporters can also be ordered from:

*The 'See Change' Campaign,*  
1436 U Street, NW, #301,  
Washington,

DC 20009, USA

Tel: +1(202)986-6095

Fax: +1(202)332-7995

E-mail [info@seechange.org](mailto:info@seechange.org)

David Nolan is Senior Associate,  
Communications and Education,  
at Catholics for a Free Choice.

## Proposition pour le débat : renforcer le contrôle des grandes activités économiques internationales

Parmi les points soulevés dans les débats autour de l'OMC se trouvent à nouveau posée la question du contrôle du rôle des entreprises multinationales et plus généralement des activités économiques fortement exportatrices ou importatrices de biens et de services.

Les Etats se révèlent impuissants à exercer un véritable contrôle ou en sont complices en soutenant fortement leurs activités. La société civile ne peut rien attendre dans l'immédiat d'une hypothétique réglementation au niveau des Etats ou au niveau international. Des initiatives doivent donc être prises en poussant l'avantage qu'a procuré l'échec de l'ouverture d'un nouveau round de négociations commerciales internationales.

L'évolution du contrôle des grandes sociétés de capitaux s'inscrit dans un mouvement historique qui a commencé à partir de la 2ème

moitié du 19ème siècle. A cette époque fut reconnue la légitimité du droit à l'information et au contrôle des apporteurs de capitaux, forme de démocratie censitaire, qui a repris vigueur ces dernières années avec l'apparition et le rôle actif des fonds de pension par rapport à la gouvernance d'entreprise. Le 20ème siècle a vu la consécration de la légitimité du droit d'information et de regard d'une deuxième catégorie de parties prenantes : les salariés et leur représentation syndicale. On voit déjà poindre ce que sera l'étape suivante au 21ème siècle : la reconnaissance de la légitimité du droit d'intervention des autres parties prenantes qui, d'une manière ou d'une autre, sont affectées par les activités et les décisions d'une entreprise (en matière de santé, sécurité...): fournisseurs, sous-traitants, clients, consommateurs, usagers.

riverains, communautés de proximité, etc.

Actuellement, ce droit d'intervention peut, certes s'exercer par voie de justice. Mais il s'agit d'aller plus loin et de faire reconnaître cette intervention au sein de l'entreprise, sous forme de dialogue permanent entre les différents protagonistes. Cette reconnaissance institutionnelle au nom d'un droit de surveillance d'activités ayant des effets sur des personnes et des groupes, sera, bien entendu, combattue, au nom du droit de propriété, de la liberté du commerce, du secret des affaires...

Mais d'ores et déjà, de grandes firmes à caractère multinational, encouragées par de grands cabinets d'audit et de conseil d'origine anglo-saxonne, admettent la nécessité de dialoguer avec des parties prenantes extérieures et d'intégrer leurs attentes dans la

stratégie d'entreprise, en maîtrisant le processus de la concertation. Certaines firmes, en particulier celles qui sous-traitent leur production dans le Tiers-monde, vont même jusqu'à rechercher l'attribution d'une « certification sociale », dans le but de garantir aux consommateurs que leurs produits ont été fabriqués en respectant les normes des conventions internationales du travail. La société civile ne doit pas se faire prendre de court par ce patronat éclairé qui vise, en fait, à produire, pour certains, une bonne image de marque sociale qui constituera un atout compétitif par rapport à des concurrents moins avisés.

La proposition consiste donc à avancer l'idée de la constitution dans les entreprises de taille importante, de comités permanents d'audit associant l'ensemble des parties prenantes concernées par les effets des activités de l'entreprise, avec un droit d'information et de consultation. Les attributions de ce comité d'audit seraient définies sur le même type que ceux des comités d'entreprise ; il pourrait disposer des moyens d'investigation des comités d'audit institués selon l'exemple de la gouvernance d'entreprise et rassemblerait des personnes élues ou représentatives sur le modèle, par exemple, d'un conseil de lycée ou de collège.

Lé but de ces comités n'est pas d'entretenir un forum d'agitation permanente, mais de permettre un réel dialogue entre des mondes qui, généralement, ne se connaissent pas et ne se comprennent pas. Il s'agit en fait, de rendre plus transparent et plus explicite le contrat tacite entre les entreprises et la société civile concernant les droits et les devoirs de celles-ci à l'égard de l'utilisation des ressources communes relevant du patrimoine humain collectif (forces de travail, eau, air, sols, énergies...).

Michel Capron

## New... Creations... Plans... New... Creations... Plans... New...

Union Network International (UNI) (réseau syndical International), telle est l'appellation d'une nouvelle organisation syndicale professionnelle internationale qui verra officiellement le jour 17 janvier. Formée de la fusion de quatre secrétariats professionnels internationaux (la Fédération des

employés - Fiet, l'Internationale des Communications — IC, la Fédération graphique internationale - FGI, et l'Internationale des médias et du spectacle - MEI), UNI parlera au nom de 800 syndicats affiliés dans 140 pays représentant au total 15,5 millions de membres. La fusion a été qualifiée

de moment historique par le secrétaire général de la CISL. "Nous souhaitons que les syndicats locaux deviennent des acteurs globaux" a indiqué Philip Jennings qui devient le premier secrétaire général d'UNI.

*(Le Monde Syndical  
dec. 1999-janv. 2000)*

# The Union of International Associations

Founded 1910

Has decided,  
in order to stress the importance of the associative phenomenon  
in what is rapidly becoming a worldwide society, to award a

## PRIZE

(of 6,000 EURO)  
for a

## DOCTORAL THESIS

Prepared on a subject concerning the life, operations or work of international non-governmental organisations. The competition is open to students of all nationalities.

Whatever his or her specialty, the candidate must meet the conditions laid down by his or her own University for acceptance as a thesis candidate. Subjects suggested by candidates must be approved by a local course director and accompanied by a short note setting out the broad lines of the intended research. Candidatures have to be received by UIA before the 14th October 2000. The UIA Council reserves its right to accept only the more interesting or the more original subjects for competition. It will inform the candidate of its decision in due time.

The thesis has to be upheld in 1999 or, at the latest, before the 1st November 2000. Manuscripts must be written in English or French and sent to the UIA secretariat in triplicate before 1 January 2001. The UIA Council will proceed to set up a jury of qualified persons who will have full discretion in awarding, or if necessary, dividing the prize (or withholding any award)

The official award of the prize will take place during the UIA General Assembly 2001.

*All additional information may be obtained from :*  
*The Secretariat of UIA, 40, rue Washington, B-1050 Brussels (Belgium)*  
*Tel (32 2)640 18 08 - Fax (32 2)643 61 99*  
*E-mail [uia@uia.be](mailto:uia@uia.be) - Website <http://www.uia.org/>*

L'Union des Associations Internationales  
Fondée en 1910

a décidé  
pour souligner l'importance du phénomène associatif dans une société en  
voie de mondialisation rapide, d'attribuer un

## PRIX

(d'un montant de 6.000 EURO)  
à une

# THESE DE DOCTORAT

rédigée sur un sujet touchant à l'histoire, à la vie, au fonctionnement ou à l'action des organisations internationales non-gouvernementales. Le concours est ouvert aux étudiants de toutes nationalités.

Quelle que soit sa spécialité, le candidat devra remplir les conditions requises par son Université d'origine pour être admis à préparer une thèse. Les candidatures devront parvenir à l'U.A.I. avant le 14 octobre 2000. Les sujets proposés par les candidats devront être approuvés par un Directeur de thèse local et accompagnés d'une courte notice destinée à faire ressortir les principaux axes de la recherche. Le Conseil de l'U.A.I. se réserve de ne retenir, en vue du concours, que les sujets les plus intéressants ou les plus originaux. Il en informera les candidats en temps utile.

La thèse devra avoir été soutenue en 1999 ou, au plus tard, avant le 1er novembre 2000. Elle devra être rédigée en anglais ou en français et remise en 3 exemplaires au Secrétariat de l'U.A.I. avant le 1er janvier 2001. Le Conseil de l'U.A.I. aura la charge de constituer un Jury de personnalités hautement qualifiées, qui aura toute latitude pour décerner ou pour partager éventuellement le prix (ou pour n'en décerner aucun).

La remise du prix décerné par l'U.A.I. aura lieu en 2001 à l'occasion de son Assemblée Générale.

*Pour tous renseignements complémentaires, prière de s'adresser au :*

*Secrétariat de l'U.A.I., 40, rue Washington , B-1050 Bruxelles (Belgique)  
Tel (32 2)640 18 08 - Fax (32 2)643 61 99  
E-Mail [uia@uia.be](mailto:uia@uia.be) - Website <http://www.uia.org/>*

# Who's Who in International Organizations

*A biographical encyclopedia of leading personalities in international organizations*

Edited by the Union of International Associations  
3rd edition - 1999, 3 volumes, hard cover

*Who's Who in International Organizations* is a unique reference work which provides biographical information on eminent individuals associated with international organizations.

The purpose of this series is:

- to provide information on the principal personalities involved in the development, operation and coordination of international organizations, associations, institutes, networks, programmes and other bodies described in the *Yearbook of International Organizations*;
- to provide an easy means of checking biographical details of significant individuals on the multinational and global levels;
- to provide a resource for the development of inter-organizational relationships.

This updated 3rd edition of *Who's Who in International Organizations* lists over 13,000 presidents, general secretaries, executive directors, chairmen and other officers active in every field of human endeavour. Some 12,000 international organizations are represented.

The organizations whose officers are included range from United Nations agencies to trade associations, from scientific institutes to development networks, from sports federations to financial institutions. Virtually every form of organization described in the *Yearbook of International Organizations* is represented in this edition of *Who's Who in International Organizations*.

The biographical entries include such information as:

Career information: previous and current positions in international, regional, or national organizations; previous and current positions in commercial enterprises, educational institutions, or other; titles of published works; participation at recent significant conferences; field of work.  
Personal information: complete name, including titles and aliases; honours conferred; nationality; date and place of birth; family; leisure interests.

Educational background: academic degrees, dates and names of educational institutions.

Addresses: electronic and postal mailing addresses, website addresses, and residential address.

The entries are listed alphabetically by surname. Three indexes provide further access to the entries. One Index lists biographees by the international organizations in which they are, or were, active. Another index lists biographees by the country of their citizenship (where known). The last index lists biographees by the fields of endeavour in which they are active, using subjects and combinations of subjects as headings.

The first edition of *Who's Who in International Organizations* was published in 1992, the second edition in 1995- *Who's Who in International Organizations* has proven itself over the years to be an indispensable tool, facilitating access to the network of international bodies.

For more information contact:

Union of International Associations  
Rue Washington 40, B-1050 Brussels, Belgium  
Tel. (32 2) 640 18 08  
Fax (32 2) 643 61 99  
Email: [uia@uia.be](mailto:uia@uia.be)  
Website: <http://www.uia.org/>



Transnational Associations  
*Associations transnationales*

52nd year  
*52<sup>e</sup> année*

Some items in recent issues: <i>Parmi les thèmes traités récemment :</i>	Issue number: <i>Numéros :</i>
Transnational actors in the international system <i>Les acteurs transnationaux dans le système international</i>	3/1997, 2/1998 2/1999, 6/1999
The recognition of the legal personality of INGOs <i>La reconnaissance de la personnalité juridique des OING</i>	3/1986, 3/1990, 5/1990, 3/1995
Cooperation between INGOs and IGOs <i>La coopération entre les OING et les OIG</i>	6/1996, 1/1997, 2/1999, 6/1999.
Social movements, trade unions and coopératives <i>Mouvements sociaux, syndicats et coopératives</i>	5/1996, 6/1996 3/1997, 5/1999
Social and economic development <i>Développement économique et social</i>	1/1996, 4/1996, 4/1998, 5/1999.
Environmental problems <i>Les problèmes écologiques</i>	4/1989, 1/1990, 4/1995, 2/1996.
Humanitarian aid and humanitarian law <i>L'aide et U zroh humanitaires</i>	4/1992, 2/1994, 2/1996, 2/1999.
Language, communication, education and gender <i>Langage, communication, éducation et égalité des sexes</i>	3/1997, 2/1998, 1/1999, 6/1999.
Civil Society and the State <i>La société civile et l'Etat</i>	6/1996, 3/1997, 4/1998, 1/1999.
Internationalism in Science <i>Science et transnationalité</i>	6/1997.
Latin American and North-American Associations <i>Les associations latino-américaines et nord-américaines</i>	6/1989, 3/1990, 1/1993, 4/1996.
African Associations <i>Associations africaines</i>	4/1995, 1/1996, 2/1996, 1/1999.
European Associations after Maastricht <i>Les associations européennes après Maastricht</i>	1/1998, 2/1998, 4/1998, 6/1999.
Arab Associations <i>Associations arabes</i>	1/1998, 6/1999
Asian Associations <i>Associations asiatiques</i>	2/1997, 6/1999

**Some authors / ont publié dans nos colonnes :**

Sami A. Aldeeb, Chadwick Alger, Benjamin R. Barber, Chérif Bassioum, Mohammed Bedjaoui, Jan Betting, Maurice Bertrand, Elise Boulding, Boutros Boutros-Ghali, Cynthia Cockbutn, Jacques Delors, Adama Dieng, Johan Galtung, Susan George, André Gorz, Group of Lisbon, Robin Guthrie, Robert Harris, Jürgen Höffner, Alexandre Kiss, Alain Labrousse, Ronnie D. Lipschutz, Marc Luyckx, Federico Mayor, Elikia MBokolo, Marcel Merle, Morton Mitchnik, Edgar Morin, Basarab Nicolescu, Ignacio Ramonet, Francois Rigaux, Nigel Rodley, Wolfgang Sachs, Pierre de Senarclens, Jan Aart Schölte, Vaudana Shiva, Rodolfo Stavenhagen, Rajesh Tandon, Charles Taylor, Peter Waterman.

**Forthcoming topics:**

**Dans les prochains numéros :**

- Formalizing civil society organizations?  
*Institutionnaliser les organisations de la société civile?*
- Post-Seattle impressions  
*Impressions de l'après-Seattle*
- NGOs with legal personality under Belgian law  
*Les ONG ayant la personnalité civile selon la législation belge*
- Water management in the 21st century  
*La gestion de l'eau au 21<sup>e</sup> siècle*

Articles appearing in the journal are indexed in PAIS (Public Affairs Information Service) and AGRIS (International Information System for the Agricultural Sciences and Technology), FAO.

Belgique		EU / UE		Rest of Europe		Rest of the world Hors Europe	
		Surface Mail <i>Voie normale</i>	Airmail	Surface Mail	Airmail	Surface Mail	Airmail <i>Voie aérienne</i>
1 YEAR (2000)	BEF 2046	BEF 2380*	BEF 2860*	BEF 2500	BEF2860	BEF 2560	BEF 3040

An electronic version will be available free of charge for the subscribers to the magazine  
*Une version électronique sera disponible sans frais pour les abonnés de la Revue*

**ORDER FORM / BON DE COMMANDE**

Name / Nom : .....  
 Organisation : .....  
 Address / Adresse : .....  
 VAT/TVA N° : .....  
 Date: ..... Signature: .....  
 Please charge my / Veuillez débiter  Visa card  Eurocard/Mastercard  
 Card no / Carte n°: ..... Expiry date / Date d'expiration: .....  
 By cheque to the order of / Par chèque au bénéfice de: Union des Associations Internationales  
 International postal order or transfer to our postcheck account n° 000-0034699-70  
 Mandat postal international ou virement à notre compte postal n° 000-0034699-70  
 Banktransfer to / Virement à  
 Bruxelles: Générale de Banques, Agence Magistral, nr 210-0508283-55  
 Köln: Generale Bank & Co, nr 1-0672712-90

Please return to / A renvoyer à:  
 UNION OF INTERNATIONAL ASSOCIATIONS / UNION DES ASSOCIATIONS INTERNATIONALES  
 rue Washington 49 - B-1050 Bruxelles (Belgium) - Fax: (32 2) 646 05 25

# Transnational Associations

## Associations transnationales

Editor  
*Rédacteur en chef*  
Paul GHILS

Editorial Board  
*Comité de rédaction*  
Jacques RAEYMAECKERS  
Geneviève DEVILLE  
Anthony J.N. JUDGE  
Ghislaine de CONINCK

Published by/*Publié par*

Associations (UAI)  
(founded 1910)  
Issn-0020-6059

Administration  
rue Washington 40,  
1050 Bruxelles (Belgium)  
Tel (02) 640 18 08-  
6404109  
Fax (322) 646 05 25  
E mail: uia@uia.be

<http://www.uia.org/aiapubs/pubriane.htm>

### Editeur responsable

Jacques Raeymaeckers  
rue Washington 40  
1050 Bruxelles (Belgium)  
Tel. 02/640 1808-  
6404109  
Télécopie: (322) 646 05 25

### Subscription rate

Bf 1.780, or equivalent per  
year (6 issues) + postage  
Bf 270.

Abonnement: FB 1.780 ou  
équivalent, par an (6  
numéros) + Frais de port  
FB 270.

Method of payment  
*Mode de paiement à  
utiliser*

Bruxelles: Compte chèque  
postal n° 000-0034699-70 ou  
Compte n° 210-0508283-55  
à la Générale de Banque, 253,  
avenue Louise, 1050  
Bruxelles.

London: Account n°  
04552334, National  
Westminster Bank Ltd,  
21 Lombard Street.

Genève: Compte courant  
n° 472.043.30 à l'Union  
des Banques suisses.

Paris: par virement compte  
n° 545150-04200 au Crédit  
du Nord, 6-8 boulevard  
Haussmann, Paris 75009.

Copyright© 1996 by  
Union of International  
Associations. All rights

any means - graphic,  
electronic, or mechanical,  
including photocopying,  
recording, taping or

systems - without written  
permission of the Secretary  
General, Union of  
International Associations.

## UNION DES ASSOCIATIONS INTERNATIONALES UNION OF INTERNATIONAL ASSOCIATIONS

Président d'honneur:  
August VANISTENDAEL  
(Belgique)  
Ministre d'Etat

EXECUTIVE COUNCIL  
CONSEIL

### President:

Anne Marie BOUTIN (France)  
Conseiller maître  
à la Cour des Comptes

### Vice-Présidents:

Raymonde MARTINEAU  
(Canada)  
Chargée des relations avec  
les ONG, Office  
des Nations Unies  
Turkia OULD DADDAH  
(Mauritanie)  
Directeur général de l'Institut  
international des sciences

Cyril RITCHIE (Ireland)  
President, Federation of  
Semi-Official and Private

Established in Geneva (FIG)

### Treasurer General

*Tésorier général*  
Paul E. HIERNAUX  
(Belgique)  
Président honoraire de  
l'Association des chambres

(EURO-CHAMBRES)

Secretary-General

*Secrétaire général*  
Jacques  
RAEYMAECKERS  
(Belgique)  
Ambassadeur honoraire.

Members / *Membres*

Mike BAKER  
Former Executive Secretary,

Scientific Unions  
Yves BEIGBEDER  
Senior Special Fellow,  
UNITAR  
Nina BELYAEVA (Russia)  
President  
Interlegal Research Center

Paul CARON (Suisse)

Christian DE LAET  
(Canada)

President, Development,  
Alternatives, Montréal,  
André DE SCHUTTER  
(Belgique)  
Président de la Fédération des

établies en Belgique (FAIB)

Philip EVERETS  
(Netherlands)  
Professor, Institut voor

Frits HONDIUS  
(Netherlands)

Chief Trustee

Europfil.

George KIBEDI (Canada)

President, Educational

Society

Georges MALEMPRE  
(Belgique)

Directeur du

Cabinet du directeur général

UNESCO.

Marcel MERLE E (France)

Professeur émérite

Université de Paris I

André E. RICE (USA)

Consultant; Former Deputy,

Society for International

Development

Egon SLOPIANKA  
(Allemagne)

Ancien secrétaire général de

l'Alliance européenne des

UCJG-YMCAS (EAY).

Gianni TIBALDI (Italie)

Professeur, Università di

Padova, SIO-Palazzo Reale.

UAI

REPRESENTATIVES

REPRESENTATIONS

PERMANENTES DE

L'UAI

Organisation des Nations

New York: Andrew RICE

Genève: Cyril RITCHIE

Paris: Maryvonne

STEPHAN

96/1